# **INEQUALITIES IN MINING** COMMUNITIES **IN ZIMBABWE**















# **CONTENTS**

FOREWORD ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS GLOSSARY OF KEY TERMS	02 03 05
1.0. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 1.1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY 1.2. RESEARCH AIMS AND OBJECTIVES	06 10 13
<ul> <li>2.0. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</li> <li>2.1. Research Design</li> <li>2.2. Case Studies</li> <li>2.3. Methods of Data Collection</li> <li>2.4. Key Informant Interviews</li> <li>2.5.0. List of key informants</li> <li>2.5.1. Focus Group Discussions</li> </ul>	14 15 15 15
2.5.2. Desk Review 2.5.3. Data Analysis and Interpretation	16 16
3.0. LITERATURE REVIEW ON INEQUALITIES AND POVERTY IN EXTRACTIVE COMMUNITIES 3.1. Implications of Zimbabwe's extractive laws, policies and systems on inequality.	17 19
3.2. An overview of model laws, policies, systems and practices to address inequality in the extractive sector across the world.	21
<ul> <li>4.0. KEY FINDINGS OF THE STUDY</li> <li>4.1. The lived realities of inequality in Extractive Communities</li> <li>4.1.1.Unequal job opportunities between men and women</li> <li>4.1.2 Unequal distribution of proceeds between mining companies and host communities</li> <li>4.1.3 Destruction of the environment exposes communities to other societal hazards</li> <li>4.1.4 The effects of inequality of opportunities and economic inequality in extractive communities</li> <li>4.1.5 Patriarchy, disposition, gang violence and inequality</li> <li>4.1.6 Information</li> <li>4.2 Manifestation of inequality in the extractive communities</li> <li>4.3 Social customs and practices that promote the exclusion of women an youth</li> <li>4.4 The relationship between extractivism and inequalities in mining communities</li> <li>4.5. Replicable model laws, policies, systems and practices to address inequality in the extractives</li> <li>4.5.1 Community share ownership schemes</li> <li>4.5.2 Local Content Policies</li> <li>4.5.3 Corporate Social Responsibility</li> <li>4.5.4 Mandated agreements promoting women, youth or disadvantaged groups</li> <li>4.5.5 Mandatory reporting and measurement requirements</li> <li>4.5.6 Facilitative (Incentive-based) policies</li> <li>4.5.7 Inserting provisions that local people will be used "to the extent feasible"</li> <li>4.5.8 Fiscal incentives such as tax incentives, levies and subsidized financing</li> <li>4.5.9 Support for the creation of education and training facilities and programmes</li> </ul>	23 24 24 25 26 28 29 30 34 35 37 37 38 38 38 39 41 43 44 44
<ul> <li>5.0. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS</li> <li>5.1. The Government of Zimbabwe</li> <li>5.2. The Ministry of Mines and Mining Development</li> <li>5.3. Parliament of Zimbabwe</li> <li>5.4. Ministry of Finance and Economic Development</li> <li>5.5. Mining rights, NGOs and the Gender Commission</li> <li>5.6. Mining companies</li> </ul>	48 50 51 52 53 54 55
REFERENCES	56

#### FOREWORD

Empirical evidence from across the globe has proven that, if managed prudently, natural resources have immense potential to grow economies, address poverty and the systemic socio-economic inequalities. Ironically, there is also plenty of evidence showing how resource rich countries have failed to tap into the potential presented by these resources giving birth to the resource curse or paradox of plenty narrative. It is unfortunate that Zimbabwe has proved to be one of the typical cases of the natural resource curse as the vast mineral resources have failed to spur the desperately needed social and economic relief and instead brought misery on mining host communities. The discovery of diamonds in Chiadzwa, Marange, in the early 2000s gave the ordinary Zimbabweans hope for recovery from the devastating effects of the Economic Structural Adjustment Programme (ESAP) of 1990s, characterised by negative growth and poor human development indices. However, the expected did not happen, rather the discovery of diamonds proved to be a curse more than a blessing to the Marange community.

Zimbabwe's mineral governance is marred with corruption and illicit financial flows resulting in lack of tangible benefits for both the national economy and the mining host communities. Reality on the ground suggests that the mining sector has not contributed significantly to reducing poverty and socio-economic inequalities. Poverty and inequality levels are higher in mining areas which are characterised by detrimental environmental, social and economic impacts that have made lives in those communities precarious. Despite the mineral boom, in recent years, poverty and inequality have increased to unprecedented levels, with 49% Zimbabweans living below the poverty datum line, and 90% etching a living in the nonproductive and precarious informal employment such as artisanal small scale mining. Youths and women are amongst those bearing the brunt as the country's economic model remains skewed in favour of men specifically in well-established businesses in regulations, access to financing and markets.

Zimbabwe is targeting a USD12billion mining economy by 2023. This vision is being pursued amidst systemic illicit financial flows, estimated at USD1,8billion annually, growing trend of resources backed loans and increasing levels of poverty with 7,7million people in Zimbabwe living in extreme poverty and in need of humanitarian aid. This means that both the government and investors must rethink a mining model that shares resources and the burdens equitably to translate the envisioned economy into the betterment of people's livelihoods and address the triple challenges of unemployment, poverty and inequalities.

This study is a collaborative effort by ZIMCODD, ZCC, and ZELA to tackle the realities of poverty and inequality in Zimbabwe's mining communities whose lives should ideally be directly impacted positively by mining activities in their areas especially in terms of local employment, local content development, entrepreneurship and infrastructure development among other proceeds. The study also aims to raise awareness on the challenges associated with addressing inequality and proffer recommendations on how various stakeholders can contribute towards the transformation of the mining sector in Zimbabwe for it to positively contribute to poverty reduction and ending socio-economic inequalities prevalent across the country.

Janet Zhou

Moreblessings Chidaus **Regional Manager, NCA Southern Africa** 

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The consortium team comprising of the Zimbabwe Coalition on Debt and Development (ZIMCODD), the Zimbabwe Environment Law Association (ZELA), the African Forum and Network on Debt and Development and the Zimbabwe Council of Churches (ZCC) are indebted to Tactics and Strategy Consulting team (led by Prof Admire Mare and Mr Admire Masuku) for compiling this research report.

We also acknowledge the respondents who took part in this important project. Their names have been withheld for security and ethical reasons. Their time, effort and dedication in seeing the research process to the end is highly commendable in light of the COVID-19 context under which the research was conducted. The consortium also acknowledges insightful reviews and comments from the technical team comprising Admire Mutizwa (ZCC), Joyce Nyamukunda (ZELA), Rangarirai Chikova (AFRODAD) and Eustinah Tarisayi (ZIMCODD) Janet Zhou (ZIMCODD) and Moreblessings Chidaushe (Norwegian Church Aid)

All this work would not have been accomplished without the support from our development partner the Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) who invest in Economic Governance and Inequality in the Extractives.

# LIST OF ACRONYMS

AFRODAD	African Forum and Network on Debt and Development
ADB:	African Development Bank
CEDAW:	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women
EPOs:	Exclusive Prospecting Orders
EMA:	Environmental Management Act
IMF:	International Monetary Fund
IBAs:	Impact and Benefit Agreements
MMA:	Mines and Minerals Act
NRGI:	Natural Resource Governance Institute
RDC:	Rural District Council
SADC:	Southern Africa Development Community
UNEP:	United Nations Environment Programme
WB:	World Bank
ZANUL DE:	Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front
ZANU PF:	Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front
ZELA:	Zimbabwe Environmental Law Association
ZCC:	Zimbabwe Council of Churches
ZIMCODD:	Zimbabwe Coalition on Debt and Development
ZIDA:	Zimbabwe Investment and Development Agency Act

# **GLOSSARY OF KEY TERMS**

**Absolute poverty**: It refers to a situation where people lack basic necessities for survival. In economics, it is quantified on the basis of number of people below the poverty datum line. It is often independent of place and time.

**Direct employment**: Individuals employed by the company that owns and operates the extraction site. This sometimes includes contractors' staff if their regular workplace is on-site. An example would be an engineer employed on a mine site.

**Extractive communities**: This refers to communities which are endowed with minerals, precious stones and other related-minerals.

**Gender**: it refers socially constructed ideas about how a man or woman should. It is a product of the socialisation process. As a result, gender varies depending on temporal, cultural, and geographic contingencies.

**Indirect employment**: Individuals employed by companies that supply goods or services to the mining company or that use its services, that is, employment through the supply chain. It can also include employment generated through social investment activities such as local business development.

**Induced employment**: Additional employment generated as a result of the spending activities of those employed directly or indirectly by the industry. This includes things such as employees spending their wages in shops or on accommodation or transport.

**Inequality**: It refers to the state of not being equal, especially in status, rights, and opportunities. It focuses more on inequality in living conditions. It is also concerned with the inequality of outcomes in the material dimensions of well-being. It also manifests in terms of inequality of opportunities, that is, circumstances beyond one's control, which affect one's potential outcomes. This research focusses on inequality of outcomes, income and opportunities between men and women in mining communities.

**Relative poverty**: It refers when people's way of life and income is much worse than the general standard of living. It classifies people as poor not by comparing them with a fixed poverty datum line, but comparing them with others in the population under consideration.

**Sex**: It refers to reproductive capacity or potential. Thus, bodies that produce sperm are considered male while those that produce eggs are considered female.

**Sponsoring**: It is a term used in mining circles to refer to the practice where people who have resources hire youths to mine for them and then share the proceeds.

**Women**: It refers to individuals who have a match between the gender they were assigned at birth, their bodies and their gender identity.

**Youth**: Youth is a fluid concept that defies analytical boundaries. For operational convenience, the term is used within the contours of age-specific definition by the African Union to refer to every person between the ages of 15 and 35 years. This also chimes with the Zimbabwean constitutional definition. In this study, we use this expanded definition of youth because it allows me to take into consideration the period of "waithood" associated with developing countries. Waithood refers to a kind of prolonged adolescence characterised by the involuntary delay in forming a family and gaining social and economic independence from their parents or nuclear family.

# I.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Inequality is one of the many structural impediments affecting the lives of women, children and youth in extractive communities across the world. Zimbabwe being a resource rich country is therefore, not unique, as several extractive communities are characterised by poverty, inequality and unemployment, especially amongst women, children and youth. These inequalities are caused by a confluence of societal drivers. These include laws, policies, cultural practices, corruption, poverty and bad governance practices within the natural resources sector.

Although this particular study focused exclusively on gender inequalities and youth exclusion, it acknowledges that other forms of community-level ineaualities marginalisation contribute and significantly to the obtaining state of affairs in the extractive communities. It also takes into consideration that women and youth are not a homogenous group. They are heterogenous and stratified along age, class, educational levels, ethnicity and other-related variables. This study also acknowledges that there are women and youth who are at an advantage partly because of education, political connections, access to land and mineral claims and political affiliations. It is within this context that the consortium team comprising of the Zimbabwe Environmental Law Association (ZELA),

Zimbabwe Council of Churches (ZCC), Zimbabwe Coalition on Debt and Development (ZIMCODD), and the African Forum and Network on Debt and Development (AFRODAD) commissioned an empirical research on inequalities in the extractive communities with support from the Norwegian Church Aid (NCA). The research focused on five specific case studies, which are: Mutoko (Mashonaland Zvishavane (Midlands), East), Gwanda (Matabeleland South), Chivi (Masvingo) and Muzarabani (Mashonaland Central). Over and above these five areas, the research covered Filabusi, Shamva, Bindura and Mazowe.

The study sought to document the lived realities and daily experiences of living with inequality and raise awareness on the lived realities in selected extractive communities; analyse the spread and impact of inequality on women and youth in the extractives sector; establish the relationship between extractivism and inequalities in mining communities; identify policies, laws and systems that contribute to the perpetuation of inequalities in the extractive sector with a priority focus on women, children and youths; outline key recommendations to address the impact of inequality on women and youth in the extractive sectors; and identify replicable model laws, policies, systems and practices to address inequality in Zimbabwe's extractive sector. It is prudent at this point to highlight that there are various forms of socio-economic inequalities.

These include: political inequality, equality of *outcome or result, equality of opportunity or equality* and equality of treatment and equality of *membership in society. Political equality encapsulates* civic equality and equality before the law. Equality of outcome or result (economic inequality) deals primarily with equality of income and wealth. Equality of opportunity or equality is mainly concerned with access to or of life chances in society. Equality of treatment can be taken to include or at least help to generate equality of agency and responsibility. Finally, equality of membership in society relates to how various members of society are treated in everyday life. In patriachal and gerontocratic systems, men and senior members of society are often accorded high status.

The study examined the state of affairs in selected extractive communities in Zimbabwe, paying special attention to the lived realities of inequalities, especially among women and youth. The study found out that inequalities in the extractive communities is characterised by unequal job opportunities between men and women, land alienation and dispossession, unequal distribution of proceeds between mining companies and communities, poor occupational health standards and violence. structural unemployment affecting mostly women and youths, and exploitation by claim owners and mining companies. The issue of unequal job opportunities between men and women contributes significantly to feminisation of inequalities, poverty and unemployment in the extractive communities. Compared to their female counterparts, it was found that male youths were more likely to get alternative employment in small-scale mines. Because of these unequal employment opportunities, the study revealed that young women and girls end up engaging in commercial sex work, which exposes them to sexually transmitted diseases.

Further, the study found that even though Community Share Ownership Trusts (CSOTs) are still in existence, their financial contribution to extractive communities is still insignificant. Respondents felt that profits made by mining companies are distributed amongst the shareholders and their political gatekeepers. While some companies such as Zimplats, Mimosa, Unki Mine, Sabi Mine, and Murowa have contributed to community development in one way or another only a few have donated 10% shares to CSOTs. Some of the trusts have implemented a number of community development projects including clinics, road construction, primary and secondary education blocks, mortuaries, and installation of bore halls among other community development initiatives.

However, there is need to devise a robust transparency and accountability mechanism so that the use of these CSOTs funds is audited on a regular basis. Environmental degradation and water poisoning was another issue at the centre of inequalities in the extractive communities. Respondents complained about soil erosion, disused mines, open pits and water pollution as a result of irresponsible mining activities. These challenges have also affected agricultural production. Furthermore, land alienation and forced displacements also emerged as effects of inequality in the access to resources in these extractive communities. In Mtoko, Mazoe, Chivi, Zvishavane and Gwanda, respondents complained about forced displacements. Some of them have been forced to leave their ancestral lands to pave way for mining activities, which is an affront on the rights of indigenous people. Poor occupational health and exploitation by mining companies was also mentioned as an endemic challenge. This exposed the mineworkers and neighbouring communities to various water borne diseases.

This study also found that a number of socio-cultural factors inequality in extractive communities. These include: a culture of extractivism, cultural practices, sexual exploitation of women, unfair labour practices that prevent women and youths from benefitting from mining opportunities, gang violence perpetrated by "Mashurugwi," politicisation of the mine allocation system, corrupt officials from the Environmental Management Authority, Ministry of Mines and Mining Development and security officers, and MPs of parliament who use their position to 'snatch' mining claims from defenseless youths and women.

The study revealed that the issuance of Exclusive Prospecting Orders (EPOs) is hampering chances of youths and women to own mining claims, especially in Matabeleland South. The delay by the government in coming up with pro-poor mining policies and in addressing the inadequacies of the outdated Minerals and Mines Act is contributing to the systematic impoverishment of extractive communities and fueling illicit flows of natural resources.

The research also found that the current claim (a parcel of land containing valuable minerals) allocation system, blanket taxes, lack of capital and machinery are some of the factors that work against the participation of women and youths in the mining sector. Based on these findings, the study argues that it is important to promote a human rights-based approach to the allocation of mining claims, employment opportunities, and community development and to ensure rule of law in the extractive communities. Moreover, the government must ensure that rights and opportunities of youths and women as articulated in the 2013 Constitution are protected and enforced.

The current set up, where the status and rights of women and youths are trampled upon with impunity by mining companies, security forces and politicians has the unfortunate consequences of fomenting unmitigated anger and conflict. In order to address these systemic inequalities in extractive communities, it is important to promulgate progressive local content policies. It is also important for both local and foreign-owned companies to do more to promote gender equality, undo the culture of 'gang violence', sexual exploitation and reverse unfair cultural practices that are driving away women from the mining sector.

- The study further recommends the introduction of local contracting requirements for all mining companies, harmonisation of all policies and laws with the 2013 Constitution and clarification on the legal framework underpinning community share ownership trusts in the 'Second Republic'.
- It also recommends the adoption of best practices from countries such as Ghana, Botswana, Papua New Guinea, Sierra Leone and South Africa on local contracting requirements for mining companies. This will go a long way in addressing some of the issues fueling inequalities in the extractive sector in Zimbabwe.

- The country's labour laws also need to be revised to ensure that the rights of miners (especially youths and women) are protected. In addition, the government of Zimbabwe must urgently amend the outdated Mines and Minerals Act of 1963. Unlike other countries such as Botswana, Rwanda and Angola where mineral resources belong to the state or are treated as public property, the Mines and Minerals Act states that all the minerals belong to the President opening up room for the president to have wide ranging powers in the management of natural resources. The Act compels mining companies to plough back to host communities through corporate social investment and corporate social responsibility. The Environment Management Authority must enforce its laws and policies so that large and small-scale can rehabilitate the environment after ceasing operations. Failure to do so exacerbates inequality between mining *companies and host communities. The authority* must also insist on proper environmental impact assessments prior to the roll out of the operations.
- The rights of women and youths must be protected and promoted through implementing human rights laws, policies and conventions such as the Protocol to the African Union Charter on the Rights of Women in Africa<sup>1</sup>, African Women's Decade 2010-2020<sup>2</sup>, the SADC Protocol on Gender and Development, the African Youth Charter, African Charter on Human and Peoples'

Rights<sup>3</sup>, the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child4.

- There is a need for government to come up with a quota system policy in the mining sector, to ensure that mining companies mainstream gender equality, do away with cultural practices that result in the alienation or exclusion of youth and women.
- *Furthermore, mining companies need to come up* with gender equality policies to promote the participation of youth and women in decisionmaking positions as well as arrest the problem of sexual exploitation of women.
- To solve the menace of "Mashurugwi", the government must arrest all actors who fan violence in the mining sector.
- Although there are funding models that have been put in place to promote access to Capital by women and youth including by UNDP, Fidelity Printers and Refineries (FPR) and the Woman's Bank and loans, some women and youth have not benefitted from these interventions. More needs to be done to ensure that Women and Youth benefit from such funding models so that they can pool resources together, buy claims and start meaningful businesses.



http://reproductiverights.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/pub\_bp\_africa.pdf

- 2.
- https://newndpcstatic1.s3.amazonaws.com/pubication/AU+African+Women%27s+Decade+2010-2020.pdf https://aceproject.org/ero-en/misc/SADC%20Draft%20Protocol%20on%20Gender%20and%20Development19-7-07.pdf 3.
- 4 (https://au.int/en/treaties/african-charter-rights-and-welfare-child)

# 1.1 INTRODUCTION & BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

Zimbabwe has a rich and diverse mineral sector that could be (and should be) an important contributor to sustainable growth and development (Mutandwa, 2018:36). Out of the 60 minerals that country possesses, only 40 are being exploited. Export earnings from the mining sector reached US\$2.4 billion for the period January to September 2020, compared to US\$2.1 billion recorded over the same period in 2019 (Ministry of Finance, 2020). Despite this endowment, the current "free-mining" (FIFA) colonial mineral regime is inappropriate for using mineral assets to wider development underpin and (Ibid, 2012). Zimbabwe's industrialisation mining industry contributes about 70% of the country's foreign earnings (Zaba, 2020).

Compared to other countries, Zimbabwe has the world's second largest resource of platinum group of metals, over 4 000 recorded gold deposits, kimberlites (at Murowa Mine in Zvishavane, Midlands Province and River Ranche Mine in Beitbridge, Matabeleland South Province) and placer diamond deposits in the Marange and Chimanimani areas (Zimbabwe Geological Survey, 2017). It is also endowed with large reserves of coal in the lower Karoo rocks (Zambezi Basin and the Save-Limpopo basin). The survey further state that the country is host to over 80% of the world's resource of metallurgical chrome, more than 30 deposits of nickel, over 70 copper deposits, and over 30 billion tonnes of iron ore reserves. The discovery and exploration of oil and gas in the Muzarabani basin further gives a window for more benefits from the extractives sector.

However, the mining industry is characterised by predatory extractivism (very exploitative) and cautious-extractivism (partially contributes to national development). These extractivism types of predatory have exacerbated inequalities in extractive communities (Pegg, 2003). According to the 2015 African Development Bank (ADB) report, Zimbabwe lost \$12 billion to Illicit Financial Flows (IFF) covering many sectors including mining, over the past decade. This points to the fact that even though Zimbabwe has vast riches in the extractive industry, some of the resources do not contribute to national development. This is partly as a result of a flawed resource governance framework and

systemic corruption in the country. It manifests through weak security systems at airports and borders control, as well as porous borders into neighbouring countries. The mineral industry is dominated by multinational companies, which export profits from the sector with little proceeds channeled towards local social and economic development (ZIMCODD, 2017). Some of these players include Zimplats, Makomo Mining Resources, Caledonia Mining Corporation, Mimosa Mining Company, Unki Africa Chrome Fields, ZIMASCO, Mine, Metallion Gold Corporation and Asa Resources Plc. Apart from the above, it is important note that state-owned to enterprises, artisanal miners and politically connected individuals also contribute to inequalities.

It is clear from the foregoing that Zimbabwe is richly endowed with diverse natural resource wealth. However, these natural resources are both a 'blessing' and a 'curse' over the course of the last four decades. Even in post-colonial Zimbabwe, the scramble for mineral wealth by Western and Eastern powers has continued unabated with devastating consequences for extractive communities and the country at large. Not only has the scramble contributed to the impoverishment of host communities, it has also been accompanied by gang violence (the 'MaShurugwi<sup>5</sup>' phenomenon), organised smuggling of minerals and precious stones, forced displacement of communities (Chisumbanje, Marange and Chiadzwa areas), feminisation of poverty and exploitation of cheap (youthful) labour (by politically and economically linked mine owners) (International Crisis Group, 2019). In a context hyperinflation, riddled with mass unemployment and informalisation of the economy, the youth (mostly males) have been implicated in the phenomenon code named 'MaShurugwi'. Politicians have also taken advantage of the situation to expropriate mining claims for speculative purposes. In areas where forced displacements have taken place, women and children have borne the brunt of homelessness, poverty, dispossession and hopelessness.

The situation has been worsened by the reliance on the outdated Mines and Minerals Act of 1963, which has failed to compel mining companies to

<sup>5.</sup> The term "MaShurugwi," refers to a group of young and middle-aged men and, in some instances women, unleashing a reign of terror in gold mining communities. This moniker was first used in reference to violent gangs that used to rob, rape and kill people in Marange during the height of diamond rush from 2005 to 2008.

back to communities through aive progressive corporate social investment initiatives and corporate social responsibility projects. The Act lacks provisions that prevent mineral revenue leakages, opaque mining licensing, poor flows of taxes and royalties to the fiscus, corruption and human rights violations against host communities among other issues (Mupfumi & Masiya, 2016). Although the introduction of the community share ownership trusts under the Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment Act led to some significant investments towards community development, more needs to be done to ensure the participation of women and youth in mining.

In most cases, women and youth are left out developmental interventions of these leading to the feminisation of poverty and marginalisation of the groups. Women's participation in economic, political and social development is being held back by unequal access to resources and opportunities and unacceptable levels of interpersonal violence. This causes direct harm to women and their children, and wider costs to African economies (African Development Report, 2015: iii). Another group of Africans that has remained widely excluded from recent economic progress is young people. Although youth are excluded from decent employment opportunities, it is important to note that in Zimbabwe the ASM sector has

The term "MaShurugwi," refers to a group of young and middle-aged men and, in some instances women, unleashing a reign of terror in gold mining communities. This moniker was first used in reference to violent gangs that used to rob, rape and kill people in Marange during the height of diamond rush from 2005 to 2008

employed a sizable number of people and has contributed to the reduction of poverty and inequality as these miners are getting something from their mining activities (Zimbabwe's Labour Force Pact and The Institute for Sustainability Africa, 2017). It is estimated that the gold sector alone has created 500 000 informal jobs of which 10% are women and 20% are children under the age of 18 years. As intimated earlier, despite the establishment of community share ownership trust schemes in Zimbabwe, women and youth living in resourceendowed areas have failed to reap significant benefits from these initiatives. It is against this background that ZIMCODD, ZELA, AFRODAD and ZCC with support from the Norwegian Church Aid (NCA) sought to conduct a research on inequalities that exist within the extractive industry and present empirical data on how the problem can be solved to promote inclusive development that take into cognisant the rights of women and youths.



#### 1.3. Research Aims and Objectives

The main aim of this study is to understand the lived realities and daily experiences of people living with magnified inequalities in a context of resource endowment. The sub-objectives of this study include

To document the lived realities and daily experiences of living with inequality and raise awareness on the lived realities in selected extractive communities;

Research Aims & Objectives

To analyse the spread and impact of inequality on women and youth in the extractives sector;

•

To establish the relationship between extractivism and inequalities in mining communities; To identify policies, laws and systems that contribute to the perpetuation of inequality in the extractive sector with a priority focus on women and youths;

This study is guided by standard social sciences research ethics, which include: informed consent, privacy and confidentiality. In order to protect our respondents, pseudoymns are used. These include terms such as woman, a youth, a miner and so forth. Furthermore, all the photos used in this report were acquired after an informed consent was sought. For security reasons, their names and ages will not be revealed. However, the names of all photographers will be identified underneath the photos.

To identify replicable model laws, policies, systems and practices to address inequality in the extractives.



To outline key recommendations to address the impacts of inequality on women and youth in the extractive sectors in Zimbabwe

# 2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY



The research design is framed broadly within the participatory qualitative research design. In simple terms, qualitative research methodology puts emphasis on observing, documenting, analysing, and interpreting characteristics, patterns, attributes, and meanings of human phenomena under study (Gillis & Jackson, 2002). Lincoln (1992) argues that qualitative methods are naturalistic, participatory modes of inquiry that disclose the lived experiences of individuals. Consequently, "there are no single, objective reality, there are multiple realities based on subjective experience and circumstance" (Wuest, 1995: 30). This particular research methodology prioritises 'thick descriptions' and 'insider's perspective' on an issue under investigation at the expense of the issue of representativeness, which is associated with quantitative research.

# 2.2 Case Studies

A case study is an in-depth study of a particular research problem rather than a sweeping statistical survey or comprehensive comparative inquiry. The research focused on five specific case studies, which are: Mutoko (Mashonaland East), Zvishavane (Midlands), Gwanda (Matabeleland South), Chivi (Masvingo) and Muzarabani (Mashonaland Central). These areas were purposively sampled because despite being endowed with large mineral deposits, they are considered some of the poorest communities in Zimbabwe.



Illustration by Admire Masuku

# 2.3. Methods of Data Collection

In terms of data collection instruments, the qualitative research deployed research which included: Focus instruments, Group Discussions (FGD's). Three groups were created for this research, a youth group, youth and females group and another one with female and male adults. FGDs were conducted at the Granite Stones in Mutoko, Jumbo Mine, Ran Mine, Muzarabani, Zvishavane urban, Chivi Murowa Diamonds, Sabi Vlei Mine, Binyup Mine, Filabusi Centre, Fred Mine, Gwanda-Vumbachigwe, FM Mine and West Nicholson. The research also relied on document analysis, desk review and key informant interviews. As pointed out earlier, case provinces included: Mashonaland Midlands, Masvingo, Fast. Matabeleland South, and Mashonaland Central. These provinces are some of the resourceendowed areas in Zimbabwe with mineral deposits such as gold, diamond, platinum, chrome, black granite, oil and gas. However, people living in these areas, especially women and youth who are not economically and politically connected are still caught up in the web of poverty and structural inequalities. Although there is no disaggregated data to back up this claim, anecdotal suggests that the state of affairs in most extractive communities.

# 2.4. Key Informant Interviews

Key informant interviews were used to collect information from community leaders. professionals, and residents-who have firsthand knowledge about the daily realities and lived experiences of people living with inequalities in Chivi, Zvishavane, Muzarabani, Gwanda and Mutoko. Experts working for NGOs with knowledge about management of natural resources in Zimbabwe were also consulted. Because of Covod-19 restrictions online interviews with mining executives in Shamva, Bindura, Chivi and Zvishavane were also conducted to understand how they are addressing issues of structural inequalities in their host communities.



Illustration by Admire Masuku

# 2.5.List of key informants

#### 2.5.1. Focus Group Discussions

FGDs were also utilised to understand women and youths perceptions, attitudes, beliefs and opinion towards living with inequalities in their areas. In this study, three FGDs were conducted in each of the five case areas. Each group was made up of 5 and to 10 participants discussions were conducted using local languages in order to promote maximum participation. The groups were divided into three categories; youth only, women and youth and women and men. This technique was used to get authentic responses from participants on the lived realities; and to ascertain practices that encourage inequality in mining communities.

## 2.5.2. Desk Review

Primary evidence was buttressed with a comprehensive review of literature. In this study, desk review was utilized to analyse and identify policies, laws and systems that contribute to the perpetuation of inequality in the extractive sector with a priority focus on women, children and youths. Replicable model laws, policies, systems and practices that address inequality in the extractives were then identified using this method. This entailed an in-depth qualitative analysis of data or information that was either gathered by someone else (e.g., researchers, institutions, other NGOs, etc.) or for some other purpose than the one currently being considered, or offen a combination of the two (Cnossen 1997).

In this research, laws, policies, research reports, best practices, and shadow reports were referred

to. Sources of desk research included: research journals, newspapers, study books, and quarterly and annual reports on Zimbabwe's extractive industries. The researchers also utilised periodic reports produced by consortium members - ZELA, AFRODAD, ZIMCODD and ZCC. Thus, secondary data provided a cost-effective way of understanding issues, practices, laws and the spread of inequalities in the extractive industry. This data collection technique complemented key informant interviews and FGDs with women and youth as well as change agents in the five case areas chosen for this particular.

# 2.5.3. Data Analysis and Interpretation

All the data collected using desk research, key informant interviews and focus group discussions were transcribed and analysed using thematic and narrative analysis.

# 3.0. LITERATURE REVIEW ON INEQUALITIES & POVERTY IN EXTRACTIVE COMMUNITIES

There is a growing body of literature that focuses extensively on the link between poverty predatorv inequalities, and extractivism in Africa and across the world. This literature (Pegg, 2003; Nsaikila, 2015; Maconachie, Srinivasan, and Menzies, 2015) paints a rather bleak outlook in terms of the contributions of the mining industry towards poverty eradication. The link natural between resource extraction, economic growth and poverty reduction has generated heated debate amongst development scholars, sociologists and economists (Gilberthorpe and Banks, 2012; Hilson and Maconachie, 2009). In fact, it has been proved beyond reasonable doubt through various researches and evidence that resource extraction has questionable economic and poverty reduction benefits, and can result in severe environmental and social costs on host communities (African Development Report, 2015). Women and youth are often overlooked in initiatives and development programmes directed at catalysing inclusivity in the mining sector (Jønsson and Bryceson, 2009).

A report published by the ZIMCODD (2018, p.1) reveals that, "a properly structured and administered minerals sector has the potential to generate substantial benefits to individual economies, host communities and regions". The sector has the potential to contribute indirectly towards social and economic development through creation of employment, skills and technological transfer to local people (Maconachie, 2014). However, in practice some of these ideals are rarely actualised (Pegg, 2006). Thus, despite the prominent role that local employment plays in the 'decision to extract, the total numbers of direct and indirect jobs that are created from mining projects can be relatively small compared to the capital investments and the fiscal revenues that are generated (Maconachie, 2014; Pegg, 2006). Given the masculine and elite-centric nature of the mining industry, women and youths are often sidelined from the social and economic dividends of this sector.

Whilst foreign direct investments have increased over the last few decades, studies (Nsaikila, 2015; African Development Report, 2015) seem to suggest that the resources, which have been a major attraction of these investments, have not resulted in significant improvement in the welfare of the African populace. Because most of these resourcerich countries have failed to diversify their economies they have become highly vulnerable to global economic shocks. A number of resource-rich countries in sub-Saharan Africa relying on the exploitation of mineral reserves as a source of revenue (Standing and Hilson, 2013). Some of these countries are also highly dependent on the assistance of international financial institutions, such as the World Bank, International Monetary Fund (IMF), and the African Development Bank (ADB) (Standing 2013). Hilson. Studies and (African Development Report, 2015; Howard, 2015) highlight that these countries tend to grow more slowly, face lower living standards, and suffer higher levels of corruption and violence than resource-poor countries.

Contrary to the taken-for-granted assumption that the more natural resources a country has or controls, the more prosperous, rich and happy will be its people, evidence from many Sub-Saharan countries, including Zimbabwe show numerous conflicts occurring mostly near mineral deposits (Nsaikila, 2015). Besides conflict, studies point out that these communities are riddled with extreme poverty, unemployment and lower standards of living. People living in extractive communities have been found to exhibit a sense of powerlessness, low capacities and limited livelihood opportunities (African Development Report, 2015). In the absence of and accountable institutions, strona progressive laws and policies, adequate service delivery, extractive communities have been left at the mercy of powerful and linked sometimes politically mining conglomerates.

Mining also leads to increased economic inequalities for example between men and women, those who can fully participate and those who cannot fully participate in the mineral value chains (ZIMCODD, 2018). Because of the unmet expectations (around issues such as local employment creation, local procurement and enterprise development), the mining sector is riddled endemic conflicts between with the companies and the local communities. In some cases, local politicians and members of the security sector have taken advantage of calls for social justice to benefit directly and indirectly from corporate social investments.

As a result, few women and youth have mining claims or rights, and thus most of them remain largely disenfranchised because of lack of information, access to capital and markets). The mining industry like many other traditional industries has remained predominately male-dominated with a limited number of females making it to top management positions.

# 3.1. Implications of Zimbabwe's extractive laws, policies and systems on inequality.

Apart from weak mining laws, there are policies, cultural practices and systems that contribute to the perpetuation of inequalities and poverty in extractive communities. Social norms and cultural practices play an important role in the marginalisation of women and youth from benefiting from the economic and social dividends of the mining industry. Social norms are shared beliefs about what is typical and appropriate behaviour in a valued reference group (Bicchieri, 2011). They are viewed as cultural products, which represent individuals' basic knowledge of what others do and think that they should do. These are often held in place by social approval or rewards for conformity, disapproval or and by sanctions for (Bicchieri, Thus, transgressions 2011). transforming gender, power relations, and the structures, social norms and values that underpin them and amplifying women and youth's voices and participation in the mining sector, is critical to ending poverty and challenging inequality and lead to women and youth enjoying equitable gender and social relations.

Women and youth remain excluded and disadvantaged because of the predominance of patriarchy and gerontocracy. As highlighted earlier, inequality is the most serious and pervasive form of discrimination in the world. While it affects everyone, women and youth face the most discrimination and exclusion as a result of deep-seated social inequalities. They continue to suffer the burden of uncounted and unpaid care work and widespread exclusion from economic and political decision-making and benefits across all levels. They are exposed to various forms of violence and exploitation and experience further discrimination because of their ethnicity, sex, age, race, class, marital status, sexual orientation and (dis)ability.

Although most countries have ratified regional frameworks such as the Protocol to the African Union Charter on the Rights of Women in Africa (Maputo Protocol), African Women's Decade (2010-2020), the SADC Protocol on Gender and Development, the African Youth Charter, African Charter on Human and People's Rights, the Convention on the Rights of the Child and the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, which uphold the rights of children and youth in Africa which enshrine the rights of women and youth, one of the greatest challenges is lack of implementation of the laws and persistent negative social norms. This lack of commitment means that women and youth cannot enjoy their rights including the right to equal economic and political A number of laws and policies, rights. including some of which were passed by the colonial (Rhodesian) government, have continued to militate against the inclusion of women, youth and host communities into the mining value chain.

There are also opaque licensing requirements, Exclusive Prospecting Orders (EPOs) non-binding and corporate which benefit investment requirements, mining companies at the expense of host communities. Some of the laws that regulate mining are outdated and urgently require amendment. The Mines and Minerals Act (MMA) was drafted in 1961 and enacted in 1963, during the colonial era, under a context of repression of the black majority. The Act is being amended to take into consideration the various developments in the mining sector including ensuring the protection of the environment, beneficiation, equitable sharing of proceeds from the minerals and value addition of minerals among other amendments. It stipulates that all land is open to prospecting including State Land whether held or occupied under a lease or some other authority. This provision applies to all land regulated by the community-based natural resource management related laws and other related laws. This means that prospecting and mining can take place on all land. All land whether held privately or communally, designated as protected areas are potentially mining sites whereupon when one is granted a mining licence there is very little that other government ministries can do to stall the mining operations. For example, EPOs and special grants can be issued on any piece of

20

land affecting wildlife resources and community property in cases where proper consultation and Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) is not properly carried out.

Further, the Mines and Minerals Act fails to promote community participation through the sharing of benefits from mineral resources exploited in their locality. It fails to also recognise the rights of communities to life, right to a clean and healthy environment, or wildlife protection rights. Furthermore, the Act is not aligned with the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) Guidelines on Sustainable Mining. In other words, an absence of a robust MMA law has meant that revenue flows have been affected; the economy has lost much needed development and there has been increased vulnerability of communities living in resource rich areas. More importantly, the law is silent on provisions that can be used to prevent mineral revenue leakages, opaque mining licensing, poor tax flows and royalties, corruption and human rights violations against host communities among other deficiencies.

Therefore, the law contravenes section 73(b) (iii) and section 13(4) which provides for the right to sustainable development and obliges the State to ensure that local communities benefit from resources in their areas, respectively.

In addition, the sector is characterised by lack of transparency and accountability in the administration of mining claims. Exclusive Prospecting Orders (EPOS), limit the enjoyment of opportunities by youth and women in the mining sector. Policy disharmony and failure to adapt international best practices such as the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative and Vision African Mining (EITI) has contributed to the mismanagement of mineral resources and human rights violations. As this study will show, there is urgent need for the government of Zimbabwe to ensure policy consistency and harmonise its legislative frameworks with international best practices. Some of these issues have been flagged in national budget speeches. For instance, in 2013, the former Minister of Finance, Patrick Chinamasa, in his budget speech, bemoaned the absence of transparency and accountability in the exploitation of minerals as one of the key economic challenges facing the country. He also raised concern over government delays in implementing policy reforms in the mining sector amid reports of leakages, smuggling,

under invoicing and externalisation of export proceeds.

Other include important laws the Environmental Management Act (EMA) that addresses issues to do with the conservation and management of the environment. The EMA also makes provision for land to be acquired by the State for conservation purposes. Section 109 of the Act stipulates that the President may acquire land or set land aside for the improvement or proper management of the environment. In instances where the owner of such land is not in agreement, the President is still empowered to acquire the land in terms of the procedures laid out in the Land Acquisition Act. Furthermore, section 110 of the ACT states that the President may set aside an area of Communal Land for purposes of the conservation or improvement of natural resources or for the protection of irrigation works or sources of water supplies provided that no such area is to be set aside until the Minister responsible for the administration of the Communal Land Act [Chapter 20:04] is satisfied that suitable provision has been made elsewhere for the inhabitants who will be affected by the setting aside of the area. In such circumstances, mining operations will have to meet the needs and requirements as set out in terms of Environmental Impact and Ecosystems Protection Regulations.

Over and above, policies, laws and social customs, poor governance, rights abuse, corruption, clientelism and other 'informal' practices combine with structural constraints to generate and maintain poverty. They also make it difficult for people to initiate and carry out reforms that would improve their livelihoods. This foregoing section has also demonstrated that the current Mines and Minerals Act contain certain provisions that exacerbate inequalities, for instance, the nonrecognition of artisanal mining which is what most extractive communities are involved in, supremacy of mining claims over agricultural land rights, free prior informed consent and no provisions to compel mining companies to conduct social impact assessments before starting their operations. The indigenisation law also does not provide for progressive local content provisions. Besides community share ownership schemes and employee shares, the indigenisation law does not recognise agricultural land rights as more important than mining claims. Furthermore, the current investment laws in Zimbabwe are pro-business hence treat communal land

rights claims as secondary. Even the 'Zimbabwe is open for business' mantra is couched in a language that attempts to serve the interests of capital at the expense of creation of decent jobs and equitable sharing of proceeds from mineral wealth. The current revenue sharing laws are also lax in terms of compelling mining companies to invest in extractive communities.

## 3.2 An overview of model laws, policies, systems and practices to address inequality in the extractive sector across the world.

Countries such as Zambia, Brazil, South Africa, Botswana, Ghana, Uganda, Papua New Guinea, Democratic Republic of Congo and Zimbabwe have embarked on indigenisation or economic empowerment initiatives meant to help host communities to benefit from mineral deposits, petroleum products and precious stones. These local empowerment initiatives empower host communities and marginalised groups to actively participate in the mining value chain. Nationalisation of mines, economic empowerment programmes and local content policies have also been popularised as some of the quick win strategies for in-country value retention in the mining sector.

Thus, countries like Brazil, Australia, Ghana, Botswana and Papua New Guinea have put in place local content provisions as part of their governance framework (The resource International Institute for Sustainable Development, 2018: 17). Most of these local content policies contain measures to promote employment. Other countries have local introduced social licenses for host communities to benefit from natural resources while others have come with devolution and up beneficiation strategies, which benefit host communities. In Ghana, Botswana, Sierra Leone and South Africa, for instance, there are legal provisions and policies compelling mining companies to develop host communities in practice. However, the implementation of these laws have proved difficult in most jurisdictions.

Several countries have experimented with the idea of nationalisation of mines with mixed results. For instance, Zambia attempted to implement the policy under the presidency of Kenneth Kaunda, with devastating

consequences for the national economy. The intention was to improve the conditions of poor areas people in rural and to reduce unemployment in urban areas (Limpitlaw, 2011). South Africa implemented its own form of indigenisation or affirmative action, in the form of Broad-based Black Economic Empowerment (BBBEE). It sought to address centuries of economic disempowerment associated with colonialism and apartheid. The three core elements of BEE consist of: direct empowerment through ownership, control of businesses and assets; human resource development and indirect empowerment by means of preferential procurement, and; profit- and contract-sharing by black enterprises. A case in point is the Impala Bafokeng Trust, which became the landmark of Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) transaction in 2007 between the Royal Bafokeng Nation (RBN) and Impala in Rustenburg.

Another interesting case study relates to Norway's 'go-slow' policy in the petroleum sector, which dovetails with the socialpolicies prevalent democratic in most Scandinavian countries. This nationalisation policy ensured domestic development and industrial proficiency (Stiglitz, 2007). In 1971 the Storting (Norwegian Parliament) approved the Ten Commandments that would guide activities in the petroleum sector. The objectives of the commandments were: to nationally steer and manage all Norwegian Continental Shelf (NCS) operations; for the government to play a leading role in coordinating the interests of the country; the expansion of the petroleum-based industry onshore, and; the establishment of a state-owned Oil Company (Statoil) to manage the nation's business interests and to work together with other Norwegian and foreign oil companies. The nationalisation policy led to high levels of employment, growth and competence in state-owned companies. Statoil was assigned at least 50% stake in all petroleum licenses. It was also involved in the exploration phase, working together with foreign investors; the company only paid a small amount when there was discovery of oil.

In 2008, the Zimbabwean Parliament passed the Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment Act, which sought to ensure that indigenous people own and utilise their resources. It targeted residents from rural areas with the aim of improving their socio-economic conditions through infrastructure development, small and medium enterprise development, local ownership of natural resources, as well as improving educational and health standards. The Act also sought to create wealth and employment; alleviate poverty, and; expand the domestic market through land reform, Community Share Ownership Schemes and employee schemes (Sibanda, 2013).

Although the policy registered some successes including development of infrastructure (such as roads, schools and hospitals) and employee schemes, it has been dogged by political interference, policy inconsistencies and corruption. Between 2008 and 2017, the Act saw the establishment of several community share ownership schemes. However, the coming in of the 'Second Republic' in November 2017, with its emphasis on the "Zimbabwe Is Open for Business' mantra has created a phase of uncertainty. Hope is now pinned on the Empowerment Bill to provide a legal footing for the CSOTs.

One of the few countries in Africa, which manages its mineral wealth well, is Ghana. It has a policy of distributing a proportion of mining rents to local authorities and traditional leaders in mining communities. This decentralisation of mining revenue is legislated as compensation for miningaffected communities (Standing and Hilson, 2013). Thus, in Ghana, mining companies pay a royalty directly to the national government on a quarterly basis. This revenue from the mining sector is paid to the Large Tax Unit of the Internal Revenue Service, which then dispenses the money into the Consolidated Fund (Standing and Hilson, 2013). Out of this fund, 80% is retained by the government and used for general budget support.

Then 10% is deposited into the Mineral Development Fund (MDF), which is used to help fund public mining sector institutions and for funding ad-hoc flagship projects in mining communities (Standing and Hilson, 2013). It is noteworthy to highlight that the MDF was explicitly formed not only to promote development in local mining communities, but also to compensate the same communities for the costs associated with mining (Standing and Hilson, 2013). The remaining 10% of mining revenue is transferred on a quarterly basis to the Office of the Administrator of Stool Lands, which, in turn, dispenses the money directly to beneficiaries at the grassroots, using a formula stipulated in Section 267(6) of the Minerals and Mining Act 2006 (Standing and Hilson, 2013). The Act stipulates that the office retains 10% of the monies awarded to cover administrative expenses, 25% is provided to the traditional authority for 'the maintenance of the stool'; 20% to the traditional authority himself; and 55% to the District Assembly located within the area of authority of the stool lands (Standing and Hilson, 2013).

Similarly, Botswana signed a memorandum of understanding in 1967 in which chiefs of the various groups ceded all mineral rights in their respective territories to the state. This was codified through the Tribal Territories Act of 1968. As a result of this arrangement, extractive communities benefit and indirectly from the mining revenue and royalties. All revenues from the Botswana mineral sector flows to a general government revenue pool, the Consolidated Fund.

Allocation of mineral revenue from the Consolidated Fund is dependent on the presence of a mine in a community (AFRODAD, 2018). It is done in line with the set priorities in the National Development Plans (NDPs) and the annual budgeting process, under the of the public finance policy guidance framework. The country also established a Sovereign Wealth Fund in 1994 known as the Pula Fund with an aim to preserve part of the income from diamond exports for future generations (ibid). Furthermore, Botswana's Income Tax Act requires that income from with sources mining operations, within Botswana be taxed at source. This is in line with the African Mining Vision's aspiration that mining companies must be reviewed in such a way that minerals should be taxed at the point of extraction, as a way of enhancing the share of mineral revenue accruing to a mining country.

# 4. KEY FINDINGS OF THE STUDY

# 4.1. The lived realities of inequality in Extractive Communities

In this section, the research categorise lived realities of inequality as articulated by respondents. The responses refer to the following thematic areas: unequal job opportunities between men and women, land alienation and dispossession, unequal distribution of proceeds between mining companies and communities, marginalized from employment<sup>6</sup> opportunities, environmental degradation and exploitation by claim owners and mining companies. These themes highlight the precarious position occupied by youth and women in extractive communities. The harsh realities are further accentuated by socio-cultural norms and practice, which favour men at the expense of women in patriarchal societies

#### 4.1.1. Unequal job opportunities between men and women

The study found that there is inequality of opportunities characterised by structural unemployment<sup>6</sup> (the mismatch between the skills workers have and the jobs that are available) in all the areas studied. Most jobs in the ASM sector were preserved for men who could go underground, operate plants and equipment and use shovels and buckets to ferry stones from the pit. For instance, it was observed that men were more likely to get manual jobs in the mining sector than their female counterparts. This according to some of the respondents was caused by the fact that mining, just like farming was a physical activity that is labour intensive.

Human Resources Officers at mining companies also use this justification to marginalize women from underground mining jobs. In informal mining companies and ASM women were restricted to grading iron ore, separating gold from other stones and selling Furthermore, qoods and wares. the marginalization of women in the ASM sector is worsened by cultural beliefs that claim that women in their menstrual cycle cause 'bad omen' in mining ventures. This is particularly rampant in ASM sector in Zimbabwe, where males are presented as symbols of 'good omen'. This stereotyping, which is circulated via the word of mouth, prevents women from accessing mining claims.



Caption: Women grade gold ore at Jumbo Mine. Picture by Rufaro Mbundure

Women and youths interviewed in Chivi said most of them are idle due to structural unemployment. The company requires locals to have 5 Ordinary Levels in order to get employment. As a result, only 3 women from the community are working as general workers at the mine. This is a common trend in most mining companies that have an unwritten law of excluding women. In Mutoko, women said most of them are employed as "cleaners and security personnel." The research found that most mining companies pay lip service to gender do mainstreaming and not adhere to empowerment policies. However, a mining executive in Bindura said most formal mines have empowerment and gender policies that have seen youth and women rising to management positions because of regular inspections by the Ministry of Mines officials. He, however, acknowledged that, "the mining industry is dominated by males."

#### 4.1.2. Unequal distribution of proceeds between mining companies and host communities

The research found that communities that live in the vicinity of mining companies have not benefitted much from mining operations. While companies and individuals that operate in their area harvest millions of dollars from mining the communities live in abject poverty with a few youth and women number of directly benefitting. Youth and women's failure to fully participate in mining is hampered by structural unemployment, unfair cultural practices, and incapacitation and gang violence.

From the research, it emerged that youth in Mazoe are allowed to mine by security personnel in different companies but they must part with 33% of their gold earnings paid to the security. They also have to share the remainder with people who would have sponsored them. In other areas such as Filabusi and Zvishavane the youth have to pay "passage" fees to be allowed into mining companies because it "does not pay to work as a full time employee due to the low wages and salaries that are paid in bond notes (Zimbabwe's surrogate currency)." At a mine, which is located in Zvishavane Town, youths and women are allowed to mine in one of the areas but when their ore produces less than 8 grams of gold, they get nothing from the mine owner. One woman had this to say:



Caption: Milling plant at Sabi Vlei Mine in Zvishavane. Photo by Admire Masuku. Mine milling plant in Midlands

#### Mine milling plant in Midlands

At one of the mines in the Midlands Province, the owner of the plant allows youths and women to mine in his tribute but if they get less than 8grams of gold he does not pay them. Miners are only paid if they get more than 8 grams of gold. Women and youth interviewed said the mine owner requires them to buy their own protective clothing, own food and to pay own rent but gives them \$100 per month. Some complained that they had gone for two months without receiving their pay, had been dismissed from the mine. They were had since taken their issue to the Labour Court. Below is the picture of the youths.



Caption: Lynette Mare (Research assistant) talks to youths who were dismissed from Sabi Vlei Mine in the Midlands Province without pay after working for two months. Picture by Admire Masuku

Women and the youth interviewed in Chivi (Sese) area in Masvingo where Murowa Diamonds is exploring said since the mining company started operations in 2018, it has done more harm than good to the community. The visibly angry villagers accused the mining company of invading; and illegally occupying Danhamombe Secondary School premises in Ward 20. However, a Councilor from the area said the company created employment for the locals by recruiting 5% of the workforce from the community. Locals who had five (5) Ordinary Levels passes are given three (3) months contracts but they are required to pick papers with a Yes or No

message as part of the recruitment process. Those who picked YES papers were given employment while those who chose NO papers were told to wait for three (3) months when contracts for those employed lapsed.

However, management level employees are brought from outside the community. As part of CRS the mine constructed six (6) boreholes in the area.

In Bindura, Mazoe and Shamva most of the labour force comes from the surrounding areas but the youth are not directly benefitting from operations as most of them are subcontracted by business people, politicians and people coming from other provinces to mine for them. In Mazoe, a female miner at Jumbo Mine said:

> Kunoku vanhu varikurwadziwa" (people are not happy). The police are contracted by mining companies to provide security, and in some instances, they set dogs on the miners so that they collect their ore. Some of us are old.

According to women who were interviewed, youths who are idle are now "involved in

social ills such as prostitution, drug abuse (abusing 'musombodhiya') and gangsterism".

#### 4.1.3 Destruction of the environment exposes communities to other societal hazards

Although at face value, environmental degradation and water poisoning is a result of mining activities, it is important to underscore the fact that wanton destruction of the environment through formal and informal mining activities further entrenches poverty in extractive communities. The destruction of the environment (especially via river siltation, water poisoning, destruction of fertile agricultural land and often deforestation) affect women disproportionately who end up having to walk long distances to fetch water, firewood and accessing grazing land. Respondents complained that mining activities were affecting agricultural activities because of the use of dangerous chemicals as well as the resultant galleys, which affect water harvesting through rivers and dams. Some of the respondents in Mtoko, Gwanda, Zvishavane and Bindura expressed concern

over cases of air and water pollution that is affecting their communities. In Chivi, villagers accused Murowa Diamonds of "improperly disposing of chemicals that are killing our livestock."

The same problem was also raised by some residents in Mutoko. They said that miners at had Natural Stone degraded the environment making it difficult for their livestock to survive. This further worsened the issue of absolute poverty in these extractive communities. In Chivi, villagers said Murowa Diamonds using Madamombe was Secondary School resources including water and electricity.

They also complained such practices meant that the water table was adversely affected by the heavy use of water for exploration purposes. Some respondents in Chivi complained of noise pollution from mining operations including noise pollution, as the mine is located 50m away from the school. As a result of the noise, a woman said, "students at the school have been getting poor grades as noise pollution affected normal learning."

Despite the presence of Murowa Diamond in Mazvihwa, the community does not have a health facility the nearest being Zvishavane 40km Environmental about away. the effect degradation has net of exacerbating poverty and inequality in these extractive communities. It also affected agricultural production as chemicals used in mining activities affected the nutritional components of the soil. This affected agricultural yields and exposed them to famine and droughts.

# 4.1.4. The effects of inequality of opportunities and economic inequality in extractive communities

The research revealed that the lived realities of inequality in extractive communities came in the form of inequality of opportunities, access to wealth, political inequality and outcomes represented through land dispossession and alienation. People living in mining communities lack representation and wealth to defend themselves against intruders, powerful business people and politicians who kowtow to neoliberal politics at the expense of community development.

Respondents in Chivi and Muzarabani complained about forced displacements that accompanied the establishment of mining activities in their communities. They bemoaned the use of the outdated Minerals and Mining Act and Communal Lands Act to push them from their ancestral lands. Although in Muzarabani, the situation had not yet resulted in forced displacements, respondents indicated that mining pegs were put in communal areas, which means anytime soon the villagers would be expected to leave. One youth chairperson in Muzarabani, said:

> It hasn't really happened yet to the people in Muzarabani but the area where the villagers live is pegged and their fields too so anytime from now when the company starts mining there are high chances that they are going to be moved from their ancestral land.

The issue of forced displacements has nurtured an untenable climate of conflict between mining companies and communities. For instance, in Mutoko, one family refused to relocate from the black granite fields. As one of the respondents pointed out:

> There is a family, which lives right inside the mining area. They refused to relocate; they lived there, way before the mining activities started in the area.

In all the studied areas, the issue of relocations was identified as a thorny issue that fuels inequality in extractive Respondents complained communities. that mining companies were given preferential treatment when it comes to land allocation. They were often pushed to areas, where agriculture was difficult to practice. In Filabusi area, respondents alleged that "priority in the allocation of mining licences is being given to people who are not originally from Matabeleland region and most of the leadership including the Rural District Council (RDCs) are not originally from the region" hence fomenting tribal tensions. Although the case studies discussed here, do not explicitly show the unequal distribution of proceeds between mining companies and host communities, it is important to highlight anecdotal evidence suggests that mining companies generate a lot of profits but invest very few resources towards corporate social investment.

Given the scope of this study, it was not within the remit of this project to access data on how much mining companies are making in terms of profit. It would have been ideal to look at issues like global market prices of precious metals, production figures, and corporate taxes and so forth in order to compare proceeds that accrue to both mining companies and host communities. Our study confirmed earlier well-documented studies about complaints raised by extractive communities.

The findings buttress comments made by the late Filabusi Chief Vezi Maduna in a letter addressed to the President in 2018 part of which read:

The issues that I wanted to discuss with you are: Secret issuance of 17 Mining Exclusive Prospecting Order (EPO) which costs \$20 per ha /year in Matabeleland South for example the EPO for Lithium which covers Shapi-Mahongola- Gwabatema in Guyu-Ntepe-crossing Tuli river, this means we have no land as chiefs for economic devolution which you proclaimed since all mining EPOs were given to Harare guys and considering precedence Mining EPQ have over any activity in that area or land...

The selection of those who were sent to China to train in changing coal into diesel; petrol and Bitumen for the plant that is going to be assembled at Lusulu I am very much disturbed that in this team we were not consulted as Chiefs and there is no one from the communities Hwange, Binga and Lupane that has, this natural energy mineral resource (coal)."

Political leaders interviewed in Matabeleland South showed that they are not happy with what they called "invasion of sacred places and mining areas" by people who are not from Matabeleland, especially in areas such as Domboshaba, and Matobo. Youths in Gwanda who are not working for major companies said they don't have access to mining opportunities. Below is one such interview excerpt:

> The reason why we are always running away from the police is that we do not have our own place where we can mine. All the areas in Matabeleland are said to be under EPOs. So, where are we expected to go?" asked one of the youths at FM Mine.

In Filabusi, (Binyup Mine) villagers felt let down by the local leadership. Like in most mining communities around the country the mining companies' activities are intrusive and result in the dispossession of local mine owners. A member of a family that lost a mining claim in a wrangle with a Chinese and local company venture said: "We do not know what to do because people come holding papers and push us out of our mining claims. All the people who hold leadership position in the mine were imported from other provinces. We have approached the Member of Parliament (MP) from our area but the situation has not changed. We are now working for the Chinese on a 50-50 basis yet he found us mining here".

The family has also set up a home-based milling plant where they are processing ore for the local community.



A young miner, Mthokozisi Ndlovu fixes the gold milling plant at their homestead. Picture by Admire Masuku.

Sometimes we are raided by members of the police who accuse us of milling gold without a licence. During this lockdown people from the community who wanted to process their ore come to us because we offer affordable service compared to the Chinese milling plant. But that almost resulted me in being arrested.

The research also found that some villagers who are interested in venturing into mining do not have capital to pay for legal fees to challenge "intruders." They also said because of the numerous licences that are required by the Ministry of Mines and Mining development and the Environment Management Agency (EMA) among other requirements most are discouraged from formalizing operations.

It is clear from the foregoing that land is a key economic resource and deprivation from it exposes extractive communities to the shocks of poverty. For instance, in areas where women and men were displaced, it was mentioned that women ended up travelling long distances to access basic social amenities. Some communities were pushed off fertile agricultural land, which exposed them to endemic poverty, socioeconomic insecurities and food insecurity.

### 4.1.5 Patriarchy, disposition, gang violence and inequality

The issue of poor occupational health standards amongst artisanal miners was also another matter, which came out prominently amongst our respondents. They argued that lack of proper mining equipment exposed them to injuries and sometimes deaths. They indicated that some youths have lost their lives because of the informal operations in Mazoe, Bindura, Zvishavane and Gwanda. One female miner at Jumbo Mine said:

> We do not have equipment and cannot do underground mining because it is too physical and dangerous. Nedzimwe nguva migodhi iyi inodhirika (Sometimes these mines collapse on us).

Other women at the mine said they are not involved in formal mining because of the prevalence of the threat of "*Mashurugwi*", corruption and sexual violence. As a result, they are forced to provide complementary work to men or retreat to violence free areas.

> "Most of the women have retreated to alluvial mining where there is less labour and violence," said one of the women miners." This form of mining is less profitable when compared to underground mining but is an alternative for women and youths who find themselves elbowed out of lucrative areas.

Mining in this part of the country is characterised by sponsored gang violence (*Mashurugwi*), interference by members of state security, corruption and sexual exploitation. According to young women



# 4.1.6 Information poverty

Information poverty has been defined as the which individuals 'situation in and communities, within a given context, do not have the requisite skills, abilities or material means to obtain efficient access to information, interpret it and apply it appropriately. It is further characterized by a lack of essential information and a poorly developed information infrastructure'. FGDs conducted revealed that some of the locals suffer from information poverty and do not have proper training on how to process mining papers. This information poverty manifests through limited access to reliable on how to process mining claims, approved minerals buyers, corporate social investment budgets and the information on the budgets of community share ownership trusts. Below one of our respondents indicated that:

> "All we know is mining. We wish to know how the application process is conducted," said another local miner who at some point was involved in a tussle with the Chinese-run mine over a boundary dispute.

Similarly, in Muzarabani villagers have scant knowledge of the gas and oil explorations being undertaken by Invictus Energy. This was captured as follows:

We just hear about the story and see people who are said to be surveying but we do not have any detailed information.

Despite this, they are hopeful the company may bring positive results. One respondent said:

> "People survive on alluvial mining. But, we hope that the discovery of oil and gas will uplift our area," said a man from Muzarabani.

For a long time people in this part of the country have survived on selling Masawu

and cotton farming although they are facing climate change – related challenges

With nowhere to mine, youths at FM Mine in Gwanda said they fight running battles with police who chase them from claims that are owned by ZANU-PF Women's league members. Here, sponsoring was found to be dominant as was the case in Mutoko, Bindura, Shamva, Chivi and Filabusi, where politicians owned mining claims; and recruited cheap labour from nearby areas. "Sponsoring" is a term used in mining circles to refer to the practice where people who have resources hire youths to mine for them and then share the proceeds.

The youths, usually young men are given equipment, food, and explosives and in some cases safety wear to do mining on behalf of the sponsor. They work for women and share the proceeds at a 50% rate with mine owners. The youths cook and sleep in makeshift tents show in the picture above. Sponsoring was found to be common in Mazoe, Zvishavane, Filabusi and Gwanda where gold mineral deposits are found. Youths who were interviewed in these areas said they do not have their own mining areas and do not have capital and machinery to do underground mining as such they have opted to hire their labour to those who have mines and the means.

However, some of the youths have formed groups and are providing labour to ZANU PF Women's League politicians who were allocated land at a place called FM named after ZBC Antennas in the nearby mountain. Afflicted by poverty of information, lack resources and capital to acquire claims the youth are desperate:

We also want our own claims but we do not know how to get them. We are also tired of running battles with police and we find this a better option because the police don't chase us away and they know that this area belongs to ZANU-PF women's League members. some of the men allegedly demand sexual favours to assist women who want to mine and those seeking protection from violent gangs.

This was found to be common at Sabi Vlei, (Zvishavane) where women said they were discouraged by "Mashurugwi" violence to take part in mining activities, especially in areas such as Mazvihwa and Monte Carlo. As a result:

We have decided to sell food and wares to the miners. This is less dangerous. We just have to wait for when the miners process sell gold to get our money. We cannot compete with men to dig for ore, we do not have equipment and the work is too physical. Sometimes these men demand sexual favours or money to help us.



## 4.2 Manifestation of inequality in the extractive communities

Data collected from key informant interviews revealed that, "most women and youths are involved in informal (mostly illegal) mining particularly in gold and diamond mining." A limited number of these groups work on a fulltime basis in formal mines or have their own mining claims. According to one journalist who writes on mining issues in Zimbabwe, "this is because women lack financial resources to venture into riff mining and mining companies overlook women when taking employees." The spread and impact of inequalities on women and youths is as varied as the areas studied. There is evidence to show that several mining companies are taking steps to cede part of their mining claims to extractive communities although the process is not standardised, lacks form and in some instances, it is done for formality's sake and political correctness and not genuine community empowerment.

Although it would have been more invaluable if we could have supplemented our qualitative data with geological survey datasets (especially taking samples from some of these mines and comparing the data with the mines owned by males), our findings highlighted deep-seated inequalities between males and females in the extractive communities. In Zvishavane, women said they were allocated mining claims although the areas they were given do not have much ore as compared to where the allotters have allocated themselves. One of the women explained as follows:

We were given claims, yes, but the area does not have much gold.

Female miners in Zvishavane said many of them have struggled to get capital to start mining or sponsor youth to mine for them. Some have even invested their personal servings but the results have not been pleasing. Below is an instructive comment from a female respondent:

You will be lucky to be given a claim in areas known to have rich gold deposits. I had to abandon the first claim because I did not get anything after spending money sponsoring people to detect gold using digital machines. I even borrowed to pay "boys" digging at my claim. But, after failing to get anything out of that investment I had to look for another claim where I have started mining.

From the discussions, it also emerged that men were using other women whom they promoted into their "league" to exploit their counterparts. The few women are used to present a picture that women are being given an opportunity to participate in mining. Another woman from the group said:

Women who are close to those in power are the ones that benefit much and are often selected to be part of teams that allocate claims. Surprisingly, they do not feel sorry for us when we are given claims in areas that require heavy machinery and mining equipment.

According to the political leaders in Zvishavane youths were given a tributary at Monte Carlo, "where they are working and earning a living" a Member of Parliament said. But, youth said while it is true that they had been given the area to mine after the intervention of the political leadership and chief Mazvihwa, the place has since been cordoned off by Sabi Mine and police usually make periodic raids. One of them said:

> This is what happens when authorities realise that a place has a lot of gold. They send police to chase people away under the guise of restoring order when they actually want to put their own people or to take over the mining area.

The findings are not far removed from accounts that have followed the discovery of minerals in disused industrial sites - from Marange Diamonds (Mutare), Jumbo mine (Mazoe), Gaika Mine (KweKwe), Giant Mine (Chegutu) and confirm findings from reports by the International Crisis Group (ICG), Centre for Natural Resource Governance (CNRG) and the Centre for Research and Development (CRD) among other mining interest groups. Respondents felt that the current climate of patronage, corruption, matchet gangs, lack of transparency and accountability of processes, "is not friendly to youths and women and hence they're not benefiting much from mining activities around their communities." One of the women at Jumbo Mine said:

There is a lot of corruption in this area. There is a newly identified mine where the locals have to pay \$10 per every 30 minutes to the police to be allowed to mine.

While "gold wars" have lessened in most parts of the country since January when police "Chikorokoza mounted operation ngachipere" meant to end artisanal smallscale mining activities – in some areas they are still a nagging problem. In parts of Zvishavane and Mazvihwa area, Filabusi (Wanezi or Binyup area) and Gwanda mining gangs are prevalent and are, according to "sponsored" by politicians locals, and business people to fight for their interests." The views corroborate finding by the ICG that violence in mining is inextricably connected to the political corruption, patronage and factionalism politics. In Filabusi, the research found out that exploitation is structural and has a local face. Some villagers accused the local Member of Parliament of fronting one of the gangs that took over mining claims with the help of security agents. They said:

After bringing sanity to a mining area in Binyup, the MP requested the youths to organise themselves into groups as part of efforts to bring sanity to the area. But, he later removed them, moved in and is now running the mine.

In a similar case, an informant told researchers that at Farvic Mine, West Nicholson - approximately 44km South East of the town of Gwanda, in 2015 the youth:

Were given a three-year contract to mine at a tributary and were

producing between 6 and 7 kgs of gold per year but were later removed and another group of youths was allowed to mine for the remaining two years before they were removed by politicians in the province and the place was given to a retired judge.

The violent removal of the youths and their replacement with rival gangs was found to be one of the reasons for the continued existence of machete gangs in the province. In addition, violence was also found to be among factors that prevented youth and women from accessing opportunities in the mining sector. A woman in Gwanda said:

> The playing field is not level for the youths and women in the mining sector because men who are politically connected and those who have the power to bulldoze in other people's mining claims are the ones who own most of the claims. The other challenge is that security is not guaranteed for women and youths because of violence in the mining sector.



Cattle pass through natural stone mining area. Photo taken by Rufaro Mbundire.



Home-based diesel-powered gold ore millers are becoming a popular venture for youths in Wanezi, Filabusi as they seek alternative ways to survive the high milling charges at a Chineserun company. Photo taken by Admire Masuku.

The majority of women and youths in Matabeleland South said Exclusive Prospecting Orders (EPOs) have affected their chances of owning mines. One woman had this to say:

> Most of the mining areas in Matabeleland South Province (95%) are under EPOs. I was part of the group of women who failed to peg after having paid for the prospecting licenses at Ministry of Mines.

In other areas, such as Binyup/ Wanezi youths are becoming innovative. Driven away from mining areas by gangsters, poor wages, exploitation, greedy politicians and running away from high cost of milling at companies owned by a joint venture between Maranda Mining Company and a Chinese Company, youths have set up own milling plants at home. One youth had this to say:

> We realised that we cannot continue sending our ore to Binyup Mine because we are not allowed to sell to anyone except the Chinese. We had to look for funds to buy own miller at Mberengwa Turn off.

In Mutoko, the community is not happy with mining companies (Natural Stone Export Company; Illford Services Mining Company; Quarrying Enterprises; CRG Quarries and New Obsidian Granite) operating at natural stones, which they accuse of exploitative tendencies towards the youths and women and failure to develop the area despite the profits they are reaping from operations. Men from the age group of 40 are permanently employed while youths are given contracts. Youths raised concerns that:

Most of the labour force comes from Masvingo with the exception of a few locals. Also, men constitute the highest number of representatives in the workers committee hence they hardly represent the interest of youths and women.

According to FGDs held natural stone miners, "employ a few locals and hire people from other areas in Zimbabwe". Most of the people in management positions were said to be coming from other provinces. One youth said:

Zvinhu zinotirwadza zvisingaite. Pane rimwe gore ratakambouya tikaratidzira tiri 45 tikavhara road tikadzima magetsi asi takasungwa pakatonzi panodiwa mafine (loosely translated "The situation pains us. At some point we demonstrated against unfair practices but we were arrested and fined." The mine does not give permanent contracts to the youth as a result we have to work many years hoping to get a permanent place. Villagers were only able to point out that the companies built a classroom block at a local school, which is not yet complete. One of the youths said:

> It has been two years now since construction on the block started. Some villagers complained that mining operations were causing land degradation and loss of livestock, which are falling into open pits.

Villagers in Mutoko alleged that pits left by mining companies have led to loss of livestock. The mines are not protected from livestock raising environmental safety concerns. Environment safety concerns are prevalent in mining areas pointing to a failure by authorities to bring sanity to the sector. In Mazoe and Bindura miners said they were concerned about the prevalence of mining accidents at Ran Mine following a mining accident that saw the ground carving in and burying some of the informal miners. Below is the picture of the mining area soon after the mining disaster that claimed over 40 people according to news reports



Natural stone area has not seen much infrastructure development for over the past years that mining has been taking place. Villagers are angry that the companies mining granite, politicians and business people are benefitting at the expense of its population. Photo taken by Rufaro Mbundire.

# 4.3 Social customs and practices that promote the exclusion of women an youth

The research found that despite Zimbabwe adopting a progressive Constitution (2013) that guarantees the rights of women and me in section 56, a number of cultural practices and beliefs still perpetuate exclusion of these two groups from the mining sector, especially in Mashonaland Central. A Member of Parliament from the area who said:

In this region, the lack of participation of women in formal mining is as a result of the Shona culture, the patriarchal system and the masculine miner syndrome. A lot of women are not into mining. Some of them are doing farming activities while some are into trading. The youth, especially males are doing the manual work but do not own mines – the mine owners are senior citizens.

Her sentiments were corroborated by a senior citizen in the area who said the exclusion of women in the mining sector has an anecdotal history:

Kana tichitarisa madzimai, havanyanye kuita benefit directly. Izvi zvinhu izvi zvinobvira kare. Madzimai ndiwo aienda kunowunga kurukova, varume vachienda kunoshanda kumigodhi kunochera yatinoti rift mining. Alluvial yaiva yemadzimai. Madzimai vaisambotenderwa kusvika kumakomba kare ikako. Saka zvinhu zvakuita zvichishanduka, madzimai vakutanga kuitawo migodhi yavo. (The segregation of women comes a long way. It dates back to many years ago when women were only expected to do alluvial gold mining. Cultural beliefs also influence the exclusion of women from formal mining but things are slowly changing).

These long-standing traditions that prevented women from direct participation the mining sector many years ago are still being practiced even today.

At Jumbo Mine, for example, men said women are not allowed to enter mines as they are seen as unclean:

Chivanhu chedu hachibvumire vanhukadzi kudzika pasi nekuti nguva yake yekuteera ikakwana zvinogona kuitika ari pasi, saka ropa iroro ndorisingadiwe manje. Mamines edu ane chivanhu. (Our culture does not allow women to enter underground mines because they may go on period whilst in there thereby disturbing operations).

A chief from the same area said:

The Constitution encourages us to respect our culture and part of that is the requirement that women should not enter into underground mines, it disturbs operations.

Women who are into mining in Makusha agreed that the local culture prevents them from going underground to mine. As a result, most of them are either working as labourers for men (crushing and grading stones) or alluvial miners.



Caption: A woman crushes gold ore at Makusha Mine in Shamva, (Mashonaland Central). Picture by Rufaro Mbundure.

# 4.4. The relationship between extractivism and inequalities in mining communities.



There is abundant evidence to suggest that most mining companies with the exception of a few do not plough back to the extractive communities. For example, of all the areas studied the Gwanda and the Umguza CSOT have been given share certificates. However, in Gwanda as in most areas studied such as Zvishavane where Sabi Gold mine and Mimosa Mining Company are based, Shamva and in Mutoko, mining companies such as Vumbatshigwe, Farvic have only contributed community development through to Corporate Social Responsibility and as and when they feel so. Most companies did not honour the government directive to cede 10% ownership to CSOTs. The effect of this is that the companies profiteer at the expense of the communities where they are operating. One of the respondents in Gwanda said:

Blanket Mine recently constructed a Covid-19 Isolation Block at Phakama Poly Clinic in Gwanda urban. When COVID-19 pandemic started in March the mine contributed ZIM \$16 M and weekly \$5M although the contributions are made through the Chamber of Mines. We do not know as a community whether the donated funds are distributed fairly or not.

Apart from the above contributions, it also emerged that the company has also funded the Rural Electrification programme in Gwanda. However, not much is known about other mining companies such as Farvic, Vumbatshigwe, Jessie, and Pretoria Portland Companies in Gwanda District. According to information gathered, some years back PPC renovated the children's ward at Gwanda Provincial Hospital and had promised to assist with quarry stones in the construction of a classroom block at Mabheka Primary School in 2019. This lack of tangible investment by mining companies is aptly captured by one member of the Portfolio Committee Mines and on Mining Development:

Hospitals and schools in most of these areas were built during the colonial era and the immediate post-colonial era. We lost it from the mid 80s up to now where investors do not want to have a direct relationship with mining communities.

This problem, according to responses from informants interviewed, has been further compounded by the fact that there is currently no legal obligation for mining
36

companies to donate 10% shares to CSOTs leaving room for communities to be manipulated and reverting back to the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) model. Interviews conducted with members of CSOTs including Chiefs, youths, women and lawyers indicated that only a few mining companies have donated 10% of their shares to trusts. According to a chief in Gwanda;

> Mining companies that never complied with the Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment Act are just looting resources and are not making any significant contributions to the mining communities.

However, he acknowledged that CSOTs that received funding from mining companies have done a number of projects for their communities. One female member of the CSOTs had this to say:

> CSOTs have accomplished a lot within the time they have been in existence despite the fact that some mining companies such as Vubachikwe Mine have never complied and have made contributions only through CSR.

> We pray that the government brings another legislation that will give these trusts a legal recognition.

Because of lack of strong mining policies villagers felt that mining companies do as they please and their assistance to the communities is not consistent with government policy. A woman in Gwanda said it is painful that:

> The region does not have any other industry and relies exclusively on mining yet the majority of its people are not directly benefitting from mineral endowments. We feel marginalised.

Another indicator of inequalities in extractive communities was the issue of poor accommodation. Mining companies have not invested in proper housing facilities and in some instances, miners cook and sleep in makeshift plastic tents. The picture below, taken at Matola Mine represents the type of houses used by small-scale mining employees.

One of the informants, a journalist said: Today's extractive industries like mining have a sad reputation of violating human and environmental rights as with the Marange diamonds and they also support controversial political and economic reforms in poor countries like Zimbabwe where China and Russia play important roles in the country's political and economic reforms.

This is despite the fact that government officials have praised the current crop of investors. Addressing people who attended the launch of Shamva Mine in June, 2021 Deputy minister of Minerals and Mines Development Hon. Polite Kambamura, said government is happy with the quality of investors who are coming into the country. However, a Member of Parliament who spoke on why there has been continued negative perception of mining companies and the culture of extractivism said:

> Because of corruption, investors find it easy to line the pockets of a few political elites and ignore community investment. We have had investors that are coming from the East and by their culture they do not prioritise community development. Thev believe in giving royalties to the which then central government, distributes resources equitable throughout the country. This model does not work in Zimbabwe. The most developed area is Harare but it is not the province with most of the minerals. This is because the majority of our political leadership is resident in Harare.

The comments were buttressed by another Member of Parliament in Zvishavane who said:

> Mimosa is our main contributor to community development. We sometimes get funding from Murowa Diamonds and Sabi but they are not consistent. But we have never benefitted anything from Chinese companies that are mining chrome along the Shurugwi -Gweru road. When you approach them they sometimes tell you the person who speaks English is not around.

The same attitude exist at Binyup Mine owned by a Chinese company in Wanezi, Filabusi, where despite having started operations in 2003 the mining company has not done even a single project. Generally, informants were agreed that the communities are getting a raw deal from mining operations in their areas. One of the Members Parliament said that investment by mining companies is inversely proportional to the level of extraction and pillaging of natural resources: He said:

> Even newly developed mines such as those operating in Chiadzwa do not have evidence of meaningful development that is commensurate to the level of minerals that they are extracting. An investor comes, mines yet the community continue to wallow in poverty.

The research also found that companies that are owned by locals are not contributing anything to development of the communities that live in their vicinity. Only a fraction of qualifying companies, as set out in the Indigenisation and Economic Empowerment have consistently paid 10% of their shares profit to CSOTs. Respondents said while it was correct to force multi-lateral companies to community contribute to development policies must be enacted to ensure that even locally-owned mining companies are compelled to plough back to the community. Respondents said this is particularly so in instances where a mine is owned by a person from another province and those that is owned by members of parliament, local business people and politicians.

Due to the nature of violence associated with the mining sector, politicians, security personnel and local business people are exploiting resources without contributing to community development the under assumption that because they are locals, they will invest the money in local projects. This perpetrated view has the culture of extractivism and corruption as most of the minerals are smuggled out of the country, according to the International Crisis Group latest report titled: "All That Glitters is Not Gold: Turmoil in

"All That Glitters is Not Gold: Turmoil in Zimbabwe's Mining Sector" and the fact that Zimbabwe has porous borders (Centre for Resource Governance, 2020).

The extent of extractivism is confirmed by one Member of Parliament who said the level of investment in mining communities is at tangent with the amount of minerals that are exploited from mining communities. He said:

Very few mining companies have built new infrastructure projects in their mining areas as most of the structures were built during the colonial era.

Legal practitioners believe the laws regulating the sector do not promote the rights of mining communities and locals. He spoke on the failure by the government to come up with a legislation that fulfils section 13 of the constitution said:

It is not a mistake that certain resources are found at places where a certain group of people stay.

He added that inequality is created when a foreign company comes to an area and exploit resources and the community does not benefit anything. He observed that,

We must know that mineral resources are not finite.

His viewpoint is supported by a Member of Parliament who said the following:

A particular community must reflect that it was blessed with a particular mineral ahead of other areas. There is a need to balance localities and national interests.

Beyond CSR by companies such as ZIMPLATS, Murowa Diamonds, Blanket Mine, Mimosa and Unki mine among others the culture of extractivism is rife in Zimbabwe's extractive communities.

#### 4.5. Replicable model laws, policies, systems and practices to address inequality in the extractives.

# 4.5.1 Community share ownership schemes.

Based on the input from our respondents, this study argues that there is need to revive the Community Share Ownership Trust Schemes in Zimbabwe. Respondents observed community share schemes had been accompanied by some tangible benefits when compared corporate responsibility argued programmes. They that the Indigenisation Programme compelled foreign companies to plough back to extractive communities through community share ownership schemes. Although they acknowledged that most of the times political elites and traditional leaders often benefit more than ordinary community members, it was far much better than relying on corporate social investment which was not guaranteed most cases. Despite the political in interference, corruption and tenderpreneurship tendencies that have accompanied the programme, there are some success stories in Zvishavane. There is evidence that CSOTs such as Mberengwa, Mhondoro, and Gwanda have managed to construct roads, schools, hospitals and consustruction of office parks. Below is an example of the infrastructural successes achieved by some CSTOs:

However, transparency, accountability and oversight mechanisms must be put in place so that citizens and traditional leaders are in know about the whole exercise. the Zimbabwe can learn a lot from the administration of the Impala Bafokeng Trust in South Rustenburg, Africa. The decentralization approach by Ghana, Sierra Leone and Botswana also provides important lessons on how host communities and traditional leaders can benefit directly and indirectly from mining royalties and revenues.

## 4.5.2 Local Content Policies

Local content policies can play a pivotal role in setting the structural framework for incountry value retention in the mining sector. Most resource-rich states have local content provisions as part of their resource governance framework, and most local content policies contain measures to promote employment (Natural local Resource Governance Institute [NRGI], 2015). There is no one-size-fits-all set of local content solutions for direct employment. Policy settings and strategies to promote local employment in the mining sector must be particular context-specific, reflecting the needs and capacities of a host country at a of development. In the given stage Zimbabwean context, LCPs can take the form of creating an enabling legislative framework for host communities to have access to decent mining company jobs that are safe, stable and fairly compensated.

The same framework could provide share ownership schemes for employees and their dependents. Such an initiative in the mining sector can support national priorities such as the National Development Plan and Vision 2030 in terms of job creation, human capital development and inclusive economic growth. For mining companies, employing local people drives cost efficiencies and helps in the ongoing process of gaining and maintaining a social licence to operate. Examples of countries, which have implemented policies to promote local employment in the mining sector include: Chile, Canada, South Africa, Ghana, Australia and Papua New Guinea. Zimbabwe can achieve a lot by learning from these best practices in terms of putting in place context-specific local content policies.

# 4.5.3 Corporate Social Responsibility

It is also important to note that before the country even start to talk about CSR there are compliance issues that need to be addressed first. Mining companies are not paying a fair share in form of value added tax, pay as you earn and royalties to the government. Other issues pertain to the conduct of Environmental Impact Assessment. Rhetorically, are mining companies honouring their environmental obligations so that CSR is not celebrated as a reducing inequality, tool of covering environmental rehabilitation, compensation for displaced communities and water stress. Most corporate social responsibility (CSR) frameworks include provisions for local employment and training; local communities are more likely to engage with mining companies and support the goals of the project if they can share in some of the benefits. employment The relationship between local employment and social licence to operate is not limited to developing countries, or to mining projects with Indigenous communities who have land rights or live close to mining areas. There are also many examples of local employment being a major driver of community support for mining projects in developed countries.

# 4.5.4 Mandated agreements promoting women, youth or disadvantaged groups

Certain groups of people have historically been absent from the extractives industry, whether due to discrimination or limited access to employment opportunities. Women, for example, make up only 10 per cent of the global extractives workforce (World Bank, 2015). Similarly, the youth are marginalized from economic processes associated with the extractive sector.

Local content policies can be a way of rectifying the imbalance of the industry to promote greater workforce diversity. South Africa, for example, has a well-known local content framework that is integrated with broader national strategies to address the wide-scale structural and social inequalities that have existed since apartheid for black nationals. Local content policy is not sufficient in and of itself to rectify ingrained socioeconomic inequalities. It can, however, be a valuable way of leveraging the significant benefits of an extractives project to catalyse or accelerate national efforts to effect justice.

Thus, provisions that require companies to give preference to women, youth or other marginalised groups through direct employment should also seek to address the contextual factors that obstruct access to opportunities. In the Zimbabwean case, quotas for women and youths should be supported by policy provisions that require companies to implement strong anti- discrimination and anti-harassment mechanisms.

#### Canada (mining)

#### Australia (mining)

THE

LAW

IBAs required by a number of First Nations Governments in order to conduct extraction on traditional lands.

Articles 2.3 and 2.6 of the Argyle ILUA Management Plan

#### PROVISION

Impact and Benefit Agreements (IBAs) set out terms of engagement and responsibilities of governments/firms and Indigenous communities in mining projects. Consider esp. Diavik Diamond Mine - integrated approach to Indigenous training, employment and procurement; and Voisey's Bay, Labrador – establishment of the First Nations-controlled Joint Education and Training Authority (JETA) to manage the "Innu, Innuit, and Métis Human Resources Development Strategy" (IIMHRDS).

Argyle aims to have Indigenous People comprising at least 40 per cent of its workforce during operations. Agreement states that Argyle will maintain a recruitment and training program designed to meet this target and will also facilitate skills training to assist local community members to obtain "more skilled jobs."

Source: The International Institute for Sustainable Development (2018, 17)



# 4.5.5 mandatory reporting and measurement requirements

Mandatory reporting and measurement requirements contribute to the transparency and accountability of the industry as a whole and are a way for governments to monitor industry compliance with local content legislation. They can also be useful for mining companies to track their own progress in contributing to the sustainable development of host communities and creating more inclusive workplace cultures. In South Africa, for example, mining companies are required to produce annual reports that show how they have complied with requirements set out in the Mining Charter in support of the Broad-Based Black Economic Empowerment policy. There is a scorecard to assist companies in monitoring their progress, which measures nine different elements, including human resources development and employment equity. Weights are assigned to each element, and the value of the scorecard as a whole determines a company's level of compliance. A similar initiative can be implemented in the Zimbabwean mining sector. In Zambia, a holder of a mining licence must submit an annual operations plan for the coming year to the Director of Mines (CCSI, 2014). This plan must estimate the staff and labour requirements, including the number of national citizens and expatriates that will be employed, as well as the anticipated training programs. Concurrently, the licence holder must also submit to the Director of Mines an annual report for the preceding year that describes how many national citizens and expatriates were employed throughout the year and in what positions, and reports on the training programs that occurred. Countries such as Kazakhstan and Nigeria have similar annual reporting requirements. In Papua New Guinea, the Mineral Resource Authority convenes guarterly meetings where mining companies report on local content local stakeholders such as landowners and local level governments, and national stakeholders including the Department of Labour. Examples of some of the countries using this approach are presented in the table below:



Source: The International Institute for Sustainable Development (2018, 20)

## 4.5.6 facilitative (incentive-based) policies

Instead of imposing quotas, the Government of Zimbabwe can choose to apply higher preference weightings in the awarding of licenses to those companies that put forward commitments to contribute to local employment and skills development. This is a way of incentivising, rather than regulating, companies to prioritize local development considerations. The advantage of this policy is that mining companies with strong social performance in the area of local employment more likely to be awarded exploration and mining licenses. It compels companies to be awarded licenses on the basis of improving performance rather than meeting a minimum threshold. It forces companies to do their own research about extractives sites and local communities (i.e., the supply base).

COUNTRY BRAZIL (PETROLEUM)*	LAW Article 2.9 of the Regulation over- seen by the National Agency of Petro- leum, Natural Gas and Biofuels (ANP)	<b>PROVISION</b> Local employment and training commitment one of three determi- nants in awarding contracts.
AUSTRALIA (MINING)	The Australian Industry Participa- tion (AIP) National Framework (Fore- word)	The aim of this policy is to give "full, fair and reasonable" opportuni- ty in employment and tendering to Australian firms and individuals (no hard targets pre- scribed).
PHILIPPINES (MINING)	Sec. 62 of the Mining Act	Companies must give preference to Filipino citizens in all positions for which they are qualified.
BOTSWANA (MINING)	Article 12.2 of the Mines and Miner- als Act, 1999	Holders of mineral concessions must employ Botswana citizens to the "maxi- mum extent possible consistent with safety, efficiency and econo- my."



#### 4.5.7 Inserting provisions that local people will be used "to the extent feasible"

Provisions for the employment of local people "where possible" create a culture of expectation that companies will engage with local communities across the life cycle of a mining project; they also give companies room to move if specialist skills cannot be found within the local community. The benefit of non-binding provisions is that they give host governments (and mining companies) time to determine local capabilities. Non-binding provisions also give host governments time to assess whether stronger or more prescriptive policy mechanisms are necessary to create local employment beyond what is already practiced by mining companies as part of their corporate social responsibility programs and in an effort to drive down costs.



Fiscal incentives are often more attractive to mining companies, who can offset their local content contributions in a favourable fiscal environment. Incentives can take the form of tax incentives, levies and subsidised financing.

incurred in the training of citizen employees.



# **4.5.9** Support for the creation of education and training facilities and programmes.

The Government of Zimbabwe can also provide direct financial or in-kind support for the creation of education and training facilities or programmes for the mining sector. Programmes of this nature require the government to work in collaboration with mining companies, host communities, technical training colleges, the tertiary sector (e.g UZ Centre for Mining Research) and other training providers. In Nigeria, the Institute of Petroleum Studies (IPS) offers certified and internationally recognised programs for direct local employment within the extractives industry. Established in 2003 through a collaboration between the University of Port Harcourt, Nigeria, and IFP School, France, IPS works with other higher education institutions such as the Imperial College of Science and Technology in London and the Colorado School of Mines in the United States to pursue an "aggressive policy of home-grown human capital development (2018, 25). The institute is jointly funded by oil and gas company TOTAL E & P Nigeria Limited and the state-owned Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation.

COUNTRY	LAW	PROVISION
NIGERIA (PETRO- LEUM)		Institute of Petroleum Studies offers certified and internationally recognized programs for direct local employment. Works in collaboration with other postgraduate institutions in United Kingdom and United States. Jointly funded by the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (state-owned entity).
CANADA (MINING)		State commitment of CAD 25 million to the Innu, Inuit and Métis Human Resources Development Strategy (IIMHRDS) for maximiz- ing Indigenous employ- ment and career pro- gression through train- ing programs.
CHILE (MINING)		<ul> <li>Programa Mujer - supported by Chile's Ministry for Women's Affairs. Recruitment drive for women (with no prior experience) to undertake roles involving the operation of heavy machinery in the mining industry. Large-scale training and evaluation program (for more information, see spotlight 1).</li> <li>Government offers certification to companies that meet a certain set of criteria with respect to gender equality.</li> </ul>

COUNTRY	LAW	PROVISION
NIGERIA (PETRO- LEUM)		Institute of Petroleum Studies offers certified and internationally recognized programs for direct local employment. Works in collaboration with other postgraduate institutions in United Kingdom and United States. Jointly funded by the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (state-owned entity).
BRAZIL (PETROLEUM)		<ul> <li>Since the 1990s, Brazil has set aside a percentage of oil sector royalties for the Oil and Gas Sectoral Fund which supports, among other things, specialised learning at existing institutions. It has pro- vided over 5,000 post- graduate scholarships since 1999 for profes- sionals destined for the oil, gas and biofuels sectors.</li> </ul>

Source: The International Institute for Sustainable Development (2018, 25)

# 5. CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATIONS

The aim of this study was to document the lived realities and daily experiences of living with inequality in selected extractive communities in Zimbabwe. This study, therefore, recommends the following specific interventions to address inequalities in the extractive communities in Zimbabwe. These recommendations are premised on the challenges identified in the key findings section. Some of the issues highlighted under the lived realities, which are at the centre of inequality in extractive communities include the following: unequal job opportunities between men, women and youth, land alienation and dispossession, unequal distribution of proceeds between mining companies and communities, poor occupational health standards and violence, marginalised from employment opportunities, destruction of environment which further entrenches poverty and inequality between men and women, information poverty, and exploitation by claim owners and mining companies. In order to address these challenges, the study propose the following interventions:

- a. With regards to the issue of unequal job opportunities between men, women and youth, the study recommends the implementation of affirmative action programmes and quota systems in mining sector. These programmes will assist women and youth to curve a niche for themselves in the extractive sector.
- h The Rural District Act and Communal Lands Act must be revised in order to protect the rights of people in extractive communities. This will go a long way in dealing with land alienation and dispossession that accompany the establishment of mining companies and desecration of indigenous culture.
- c. The introduction of local content policies and insertion of provisions that compel mining companies to recruit local people "to the extent feasible" will also assist to deal with inequalities in the access to employment opportunities amongst youths and women in the extractive sector.
- d. There should be clauses in the revised Mines and Minerals Act, which compels mining companies to rehabilitate the environment after ceasing operations. The Environmental Management Authority must monitor and enforce the legal framework related to environmental rehabilitation and sustainable development.
- e. Mining companies must be compelled

through legislation to promote occupational health standards in the mining sector. The Labour Act must be used to ensure decent remuneration in the sector and compliance with statutory obligations.

- f. The security forces must ensure that rule of law and security of property rights is guaranteed. Those fanning violence in the mining sector must be brought to book and prosecuted.
- g. CSOs working in the mining sector must develop an early warning reporting system, which allows them to name and shame sponsors and perpetrators of gang violence. An online app system can be used, which allow artisanal miners to anonymously report cases of gang violence.
- h. There is a need to come up with legislation on Corporate Social Responsibility to ensure that companies that did not own up to the dictates of the Indigenisation policy when it was enacted contribute to community development.
- i. There is need for skills transfer and local business opportunities in all extractive communities so that the issues of inequalities can be reduced.

Respondents proffered various recommendations that they would like to see put in motion so that the impact of inequality on women and youth in in Zimbabwe's extractive communities can be addressed. Communities living in the vicinity of mining areas are not getting enough from mining companies, particularly in the Marange diamond area and Midlands Province. There is a need to fine-tune the operations of the Community Share Ownership Trusts as some mining companies are not contributing anything towards community development. There is urgent need to put in place local content policies in addition to existing, and new laws such as the Mines and Minerals Amendment Bill, Environmental Management Act, Traditional Leaders Act, Rural Districts Act and Labour Relations Act. Equally important is the need to compel both locally and foreign-owned mining companies to rehabilitate the environment and plough back towards community development leading to increased opportunities for women and youth. Respondents also recommended that local people (especially women and youth) should be given first preference or given a quota for employment in mining menial jobs. Overall, respondents in all the five case areas suggested general recommendations aimed at the following key stakeholders in the mining ecosystem:

## 5.1 The Government of Zimbabwe

- 1. The Ministry of Home Affairs must roll out a national ban on possession of machetes while supporting the #Stopthemachete campaign. This will reduce incidences of violence associated with the use of machetes, especially in Artisanal and Small-Scale Mining. This include taking measures against rogue MPs who are using members of state security to take over mining claims belonging to the youth, women and villagers under the guise of restoring order. Violence-ridden mining exploration is allowing those who are politically and financially connected to benefit from the mineral resources. Stronger representation of communities is needed as MPs are currently part of the group of people who are causing chaos through grabbing mines and using security agents to protect their interests ahead of community needs.
- 2. There is need to close the loopholes that are promoting corruption in the awarding of mining claims. The ministry of mines and Mining Development should take measures to ensure that the public has access to information on the licences that are awarded to mining companies. Currently, its website does not publish critical information about the awarding of licences, management of natural resources, and ownership of mines. The Ministry should promote transparency in the sector by embracing open and competitive bidding for mining contracts while drawing lessons from countries such as Mozambique that have adopted the process.
- 3. The government must do more to promote devolution of power, which is gender inclusive to enhance tax justice and promote responsible investment. More research is also needed to ascertain how devolution relates to gender and extractives. Although the Constitution through section 276 empowers local authorities to come up with resource mobilization efforts they are dependent on Central government for leadership direction and funding. Therefore, the government should also ensure that value addition and beneficiation plants are constructed in provinces with mining deposits so that they benefit the locals. Currently, mining companies are taking the ore to refineries outside their provinces, for example, Freda Rebecca for further processing thereby robbing locals of job opportunities.
- 4. Government must deal with policy discord in the mining sector as this promotes exploitation of youth and women by politicians, unscrupulous business people and members of the security sector.
- 5. The government must not promote neoliberal policies at the expense of mining communities. In most cases displacement as a result of mining operations does not always result is proper compensation for the loss of culture, access to natural resources and property.
- 6. The government must directly control the issuing and management of small-scale mining claims and licenses. Respondents complained about corruption in the issuance of mining claims and licenses, which tended to favour the politically and economically connected members of society. They were also concerned about the current set up where, in Mashonaland West province, Jumbo Mine was given the authority to allocate mining claims. They proposed that the role of allocating mining claims and licenses should be given to traditional leadership who know people in their communities. Jumbo Mine must desist from the practice where they get 33% of the shares per mining claim granted as this practice ends up exploiting youth and women who ultimately receive very low wages from claim owners.

### 5.2.The Ministry of Mines and Mining Development

- 1. There is need to include the "use it or lose it policy" provision in the proposed Mines and Minerals Bill, which prevent accumulation of mining claims for speculative purposes. Also, the proposed Bill must operationalise the cadastre system, which requires an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) to be undertaken before issuance of a mining title.
- 2. The proposed bill must enforce the setting up of the Safety, Health and Rehabilitation Fund (SHRF), which make it mandatory for mining companies to account for environmental violations. The mining sector has violated Environmental, Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (EESCR) of communities mainly because key community gatekeepers such as Rural District Councils (RDCs), Traditional Leaders, Environmental Management Agency (EMA) are not empowered under the Mines and Minerals Act of 1963 to deal with such matters.
- 3. All policies and laws governing the extractive sector must be aligned with the new constitution, which recognises Environmental, Economic. Social and Cultural Rights (EESCRs) of communities where natural resources are being exploited.
- 4. The bill should provide for the regularisation of artisanal mining. Artisanal miners are subject to all forms of human rights abuse by corporates and state security. The formalisation of artisanal mining will promote sustainable mining and uplift the living standards of millions of people including women and youth.
- 5. The proposed bill must be aligned to chapter 14 (c) of the new constitution on devolution by compelling mining companies to remit levies to RDCs and shares to Community Share Ownership Trusts (CSOTs). The inclusion of local empowerment and local content policies in the proposed bill is critical if government is serious about empowering communities out of mining.
- 6. In order to promote community development, the bill should enshrine local content policy clauses that compel mining companies not only to employ locals but to contract local enterprises in the procurement of goods and services. If incorporated in the proposed bill, the local content policy will give life to local downstream industry in the mining sector.
- 7. The proposed amendments should make it mandatory for mining companies to cede shares to CSOTs to ensure communities benefit directly from exploitation of their natural resources. Community Based Organisations (CBOs) and Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) need representation on the Mining Board in view of the paramount role they play in providing checks and balances to operations of government. These human rights defenders have played a critical role in exposing rights abuses, opaque mining deals and other forms of resource plunder.
- 8. Minimum wage regulations and policies must be enforced in the mining sector.
- 9. The proposed bill must align its objectives with the Africa Mining Vision (AMV), whose goal is to promote transparent, equitable and optimal exploitation of mineral resources to underpin broad-based sustainable growth and socio-economic development.

#### **5.3 Parliament of Zimbabwe**

- Zimbabwe should set up a citizen resource dividend to fund a universal cash transfer scheme. For instance, Alaska has a Permanent Fund Dividend scheme, which was set up in 1976. This fund has been tested in Mongolia. In Iran, a citizen dividend has been funded through savings accumulated by ending oil subsidies. The essence of a citizen resource dividend is that all or some proportion of resource revenues are transferred in the form of direct cash benefits, normally paid on a monthly basis, to every person in the extractive communities, irrespective of their wealth or employment status.
- 2. Fidelity Printers and Refiners must be compelled to solve pricing between large-scale miners and small-scale miners need to be addressed to curb smuggling of minerals. As discussed earlier, there are several countries, which have successfully managed to put in place policy, legislative and practical interventions that contributed to beneficiation, local content policy development and community development in host communities.
- 3. There is a need to put in place financing models, which are biased towards women and the youths. For instance, banks such as the Empowerment Bank must do more to provide capital to women in mining. The government and the Ministry of Mines and Mining Development must avail mining claims for women and youths and establish mining banking institutions that will cater for miners' needs. Although there are financial programmes put in place for miners such as the Fidelity Printers and Refiners (Private) Limited (FPR) loans, which actually have specific funds set aside for mining companies; these interventions have failed to benefit miners due to a number of reasons. For instance, the Gold Development Initiative Fund (GDIF) administered by FPR was meant to assist small-scale miners through the acquisition of gold mining plant and equipment but many people are not able to meet the requirements.
- 4. There is urgent need to put in place water tight mechanisms at our borders of entry and exit in order to plug illicit mineral trafficking. This may include using state of the art surveillance cameras at airports and road traffic borders.
- 5. The Ministry must supervise the operations of mining companies so that reinvestment in host mining communities is done. Without adequate supervision and monitoring of adherence to certain regulations, then chances are that most of them are likely to remain unfulfilled.
- 6. The Ministry must ensure that it revamps its current Public Finance Management System. Building on the on-going public finance reforms (under the umbrella Public Finance Management Enhancement Project (PFMEP)), the government of Zimbabwe (GoZ) should put in place mechanisms that ensure that a set of laws, rules, and systems of governance are put in place. This will ensure robust systems of resource mobilisation and proper management of public funds is done for the benefit of extractive communities and the rest of society.

# **5.4. Ministry of Finance and Economic Development**

- Zimbabwe should set up a citizen resource dividend to fund a universal cash transfer scheme. For instance, Alaska has a Permanent Fund Dividend scheme, which was set up in 1976. This fund has been tested in Mongolia. In Iran, a citizen dividend has been funded through savings accumulated by ending oil subsidies. The essence of a citizen resource dividend is that all or some proportion of resource revenues are transferred in the form of direct cash benefits, normally paid on a monthly basis, to every person in the extractive communities, irrespective of their wealth or employment status.
- 2. Fidelity Printers and Refiners must be compelled to solve pricing between large-scale miners and small-scale miners need to be addressed to curb smuggling of minerals. As discussed earlier, there are several countries, which have successfully managed to put in place policy, legislative and practical interventions that contributed to beneficiation, local content policy development and community development in host communities.
- 3. There is a need to put in place financing models, which are biased towards women and the youths. For instance, banks such as the Empowerment Bank must do more to provide capital to women in mining. The government and the Ministry of Mines and Mining Development must avail mining claims for women and youths and establish mining banking institutions that will cater for miners' needs. Although there are financial programmes put in place for miners such as the Fidelity Printers and Refiners (Private) Limited (FPR) loans, which actually have specific funds set aside for mining companies; these interventions have failed to benefit miners due to a number of reasons. For instance, the Gold Development Initiative Fund (GDIF) administered by FPR was meant to assist small-scale miners through the acquisition of gold mining plant and equipment but many people are not able to meet the requirements.
- 4. There is urgent need to put in place water tight mechanisms at our borders of entry and exit in order to plug illicit mineral trafficking. This may include using state of the art surveillance cameras at airports and road traffic borders.
- 5. The Ministry must supervise the operations of mining companies so that reinvestment in host mining communities is done. Without adequate supervision and monitoring of adherence to certain regulations, then chances are that most of them are likely to remain unfulfilled.
- 6. The Ministry must ensure that it revamps its current Public Finance Management System. Building on the on-going public finance reforms (under the umbrella Public Finance Management Enhancement Project (PFMEP)), the government of Zimbabwe (GoZ) should put in place mechanisms that ensure that a set of laws, rules, and systems of governance are put in place. This will ensure robust systems of resource mobilisation and proper management of public funds is done for the benefit of extractive communities and the rest of society.

## 5.5 Mining Rights, NGOs and the Gender Commission

- 1. There is a need do more to educate mining communities about their rights to natural resources. While some villagers are aware of their entitlement to mineral wealth in their communities, they are victims of information poverty.
- 2. More effort is needed in pushing for government to progressive institutions that promote good governance in the mining sector such as the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI).
- 3. There is a need to do away with traditional practices that discourage women from getting involved in underground mining activities as they relegate them to secondary citizen status. Respondents proposed that constitutional provisions (especially the Declaration of Rights), which underscore equality between sexes and genders, should be promoted in the mining sector. This means new opportunities for women in jobs, education, finance and credit must be ensured by the government and in national funding.
- 4. Respondents recommended that there was need to follow up on already existing policies to ensure gender equity and equality in the extractive sector. For instance, they observed that there are quotas for women and youth aligned to the ruling party yet these are not benefiting everyone in their communities.
- 5. Although there are funding models that have been put in place to promote access to Capital by women and youth including by UNDP, Fidelity Printers and Refineries (FPR) and the Woman's Bank and loans, some women and youth have not benefitted from these interventions. More needs to be done to ensure that Women and Youth benefit from such funding models so that they can pool resources together, buy claims and start meaningful businesses.
- 6. The Ministry of Finance and Economic Development must do more to improve transparency in the disbursement of funds to mining communities including money from mining that is being transferred to community share ownership trusts, and the traditional authorities. Companies should be compelled to publish this information in public media.
- 7. Working together with the Gender Commission, mining rights NGOs must also do more to educate traditional leaders on the rights of youth and women in the extractive industry. Currently, there are retrogressive cultural practices that prevent women from fully enjoying mining rights. These human rights violations are prevalent and some of the traditional leaders condone them as part of their cultural practices.
- 8. There are various social accountability tools that have been supported and developed by development agencies, which could be used in Zimbabwe's mining communities. These include, for example, citizen-led public expenditure tracking surveys, social audits, the establishment of citizen hotlines or report cards and the development of institutions and process to enable participatory budgeting.

## 5.6. Mining companies

- 1. Mining companies must come up with and implement gender equality policies to ensure that the rights of women and youths are promoted and protected.
- 2. Mining companies must do away with the culture of extractivism in the sector and contribute meaningfully to community development. There is a need for genuine corporate social responsibility programmes must be implemented. They argued that current corporate social responsibility programmes are meant to appease politicians and enable mining companies to keep their licenses rather than transform extractive communities. This will go a long way in solving the problem of extractivism and creating more opportunities for youth and women.
- 3. Respondents in Chivi recommended that companies must plough back some of their profits towards community development. Although they acknowledged the role played by Murowa Diamonds in feeding school children and disadvantaged groups, they urged the company to prioritise sustainable community development projects.
- 4. They encouraged the government to prioritise community development and environmental rehabilitation, especially along Runde River, which is facing the challenge of erosion because of haphazard small-scale mining activities.
- 5. They urged the government to align section 10(4) of the Communal Lands Act (Chapter 20:04) and statutory instrument 50 of 2021of Communal Lands. These laws contravene the rights of citizens to use their ancestral lands once such piece of land has been designated as a commercial or mining area. They gave the example of clashes between villagers and mining in Wondedzo village.
- 6. Mining companies must give first preference in preference to locals when hiring labourers with a bias towards youth and women. This will go a long way in addressing inequality of opportunities reversing cross border jumping, which has become endemic in districts such as Chivi district and Gwanda.
- 7. Women and youths in Chivi suggested that there is need to implement the quota system so that they can benefit from employment opportunities associated with mining initiatives. This is partly because most mining companies bring their own labour and catering companies from outside the district, which makes it difficult for youths and women to eke out a living.
- 8. There is need for mining companies to legally compelled to set aside 10% shares for CSOTs. The idea of donation as spelt out in the current legislation leaves room for communities to be manipulated and reverting back to the Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) model.

## REFERENCES

African Development Report (2015). Growth, Poverty and Inequality Nexus: Overcoming Barriers to Sustainable Development. Retrieved fromhttps://www.afdb.org/en/documents/document/african-de-velopment-report-2015-growth-poverty-and-inequality-nexus-overcoming-barriers-to-sustainable-development-89715

Alkire, S., Foster, J., Seth, S., Santos, M. E., Roche, J. M., and Ballon, P. (2015). 'Multidimensional Poverty Measurement and Analysis', Oxford: Oxford University Press. Retrieved on 2 October 2015 from Oxford Scholarship Online: August 2015. Retrieved from https://www.ophi.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/OPHIWP082\_Ch1.pdf.

Bicchieri, C. (2011) Social Norms. Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Retrieved from https://plato.stanford.edu/index.html

Bryan. S., and Hofmann. B. (eds). (2007). Transparency and Accountability: Africa's Extractive Industries: The Role of The Legislature. National Democratic Institute for International Affairs. Washington. Retrieved from https://www.ndi.org/sites/default/files/2191\_extractive\_080807.pdf

Centre for Research and Development. (2020). Parliament must investigate aviation industry in Zimbabwe for facilitating smuggling of precious minerals. (Online Report). Retrieved from http://kubata-na.net/2020/11/04/parliament-must-investi-gate-aviation-industry-in-zimbabwe-for-facilitating-smuggling-of-precious-minerals/

Chakanya. N. (2016). Extractivism and sustainable alternative models of economic development. Retrieved from https://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/simbabwe/13739.pdf.

Chambati, W. et al., (2016). Land, agriculture and extractives in Zimbabwe: An overview. Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung. Extractives and sustainable development ii: Alternatives to the exploitation of extractives. Retrieved from: https://library.fes.de/pdffiles/bueros/simbabwe/13739.pdf

Chief Maduna and Chief Sibasa (2018). Ndebele Chiefs' letter to President Emmerson Mnangagwa: Petition over Secret and current implementation of economic marginalisation of Ndebele people (Matabeleland at large) by implementing the draconian 1979 Grand Plan. Bulawayo24. Retrieved from https://bulawayo24.com/index-id-opinion-sc-letters-byo-149593.html.

Cnossen, C. (1997). Secondary Research: Learning Paper 7, School of Public Administration and Law, the Robert Gordon University, January 1997. Retrieved from https://jura2.eee.rgu.ac.uk/dsk5/re-search/mater ial/resmeth

Constitution of Zimbabwe Amendment (No. 20) Act. (2013) Fidelity Printers and Refiners, Harare. Embassy of India (2018). Zimbabwe Mining Guide. Retrieved from https://eoi.gov.in/harare/?pdf7472?000.

Erlingsson, C. and Brysiewicz, P. (2013) Orientation among Multiple Truths: An Introduction to Qualitative Research. African Journal of Emergency Medicine, 3, 92-99.

Gillis, A., & Jackson, W. (2002). Research methods for nurses: Methods and interpretation. Philadelphia: F.A. Davis Company.

Gilberthorpe, E., and Banks, G. (2012). "Development on Whose Terms? CSR Discourse and Social Realities in Papua New Guinea's Extractive Industries Sector." Resources Policy, 37: 185–93.

Hilson, G., and Maconachie, R. (2009). "Good Governance and the Extractive Industries in Sub-Saharan Africa." Mineral Processing and Extractive Metallurgy Review, 30 (1): 52–100.

Frances, S. (2002), Horizontal Inequalities: A Neglected Dimension of Development, UNU World Institute for Development Economics. Retrieved from https://link.springer.com/chap-ter/10.1057/9780230501850\_5.

Ferreira, F. H. G., Vega, J. R. M., Paes de Barros, R., and Chanduvi, J. S. (2009).

Measuring Inequality of Opportunities in Latin America and the Caribbean, The World Bank and Palgrave Macmillan.

Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung. (2016). Extractives and sustainable development ii: Alternatives to the exploitation of extractives. Retrieved from https://library.fes.de/pdffiles/bueros/simbabwe/13739.pdf.

Handley. G., Higgins, K. and Sharma. B., Bird. K and Cammack. D. (2009). Poverty and Poverty Reduction in Sub-Saharan Africa: An Overview of Key Issues, Results of ODI research presented in preliminary form for discussion and critical comment: Working Paper 299. Retrieved from https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/860.pdf.

Hawkins. T. (2009). The Mining Sector in Zimbabwe and its Potential Contribution to Recovery: Working Paper for the UNDP. Retrieved from http://cryptome.org/kimberly/kimberly-003.pdf.

Hodzi. O., & Chikakano, J. (2012). National study on access to information in Zimbabwe. African Network of Constitutional Lawyers. Retrieved from https://www.right2info.org/resources/publications/publications/national-study-on-access-toinformation-in-zimbabwe-201263.

Howard, A. (2015). Blood diamonds: The successes and failures of the Kimberley Process Certification Scheme in Angola, Sierra Leone and Zimbabwe. Washington University Global Studies Law Review, 15(1).

IGF. (2018). Local content: Policies in the mining sector: a review of key Numbers and issues and stimulating direct local employment. Available at: https://www.iisd.org/system/files/publications/local-content-policies-mining-direct-local-employment.pdf.

International Crisis Group (2020). All that glitters is not gold: Turmoil in Zimbabwe's Mining Sector. Retrieved from https://www.crisisgroup.org/africa/southern-africa/zimbabwe/294-allglitters-not-gold-turmoil-zimbabwes-mining-sector.

Jønsson, J. B., and D. F. Bryceson. 2009. "Rushing for Gold: Mobility and Small-Scale Mining in East Africa." Development and Change, 40 (2): 249–79.

Jourdan, et al (2012). Zimbabwe economic policy analysis and research unit. Mining sector policy study. Retrieved from http://www.zeparu.co.zw/sites/default/files/201803/Mining%20Sector%20Policy%20Study%20pdf.pdf.

Leininger, M. M. (1985). Qualitative research methods in nursing. Orlando: Grune and Stratton.

Lincoln, Y. S. (1992). Sympathetic connections between Qualitative Methods and Health Research, Qualitative Health Research, 2(4), 375-391.

Liu, J. (2017). The role of media in promoting good governance and building public perception about governance: A Comparison of China and the United States. Wayne State University Dissertations. 1832. Retrieved from https://digitalcommons.wayne.edu/oa\_dissertations/1832.

Mabhena. C & Moyo. F (2014). Community Share Ownership Trust scheme and Empowerment: The case of Gwanda Rural district, Matabeleland South Province in Zimbabwe. IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/272716669\_Community\_Share\_Ownership\_Trust\_scheme\_and\_empowerment\_The\_case\_of\_Gwanda\_Rural\_district\_Matabeleland\_South\_Province\_in\_ Zimbabwe/link/57fcd58108aef0731c01c6cf/download.

McCaston. K. M. (2005). Tips for Collecting, Reviewing and Analysing Secondary Data. Retrieved from https://www.ands.org.au/\_\_data/assets/pdf\_file/0003/713235/Tips\_for\_Collecting\_Reviewing\_a nd\_Analyz.pdf.

Maconachie, R., Srinivasan, R. and Menzies, N. (2015). Responding to the Challenge of Fragility and Security in West Africa: Natural Resources, Extractive Industry Investment, and Social Conflict. Fragility, Conflict, and Violence Group World Bank. Retrieved from http://documents1.worldbank.org/curat-

ed/en/169321468189569256/pdf/98902-WP-AFR-P148420-Box-393185B-PUBLIC-Extractives-FINAL.pdf

Maconachie, R. (2014). "Dispossession, Exploitation or Employment? Youth Livelihoods and Extractive Industry Investment in Sierra Leone." Futures. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.futures.2013.08.003.

Mawowa. S (2013). Political Economy of Crisis, Mining and Accumulation in Zimbabwe: Evidence from the Chegutu Mhondoro Area. Dissertation School of Built Environment and Development Studies, Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Development Studies, University of KwaZulu Natal, Durban. Retrieved from https://researchspace.ukzn.ac.za/bitstream/han-dle/10413/11493/Mawowa\_Showers\_2013.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.

Mutandwa, B. (2018). Leveraging Zimbabwe's Mineral Endowment for Economic transformation and human development, A research report submitted to the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, Available at: http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10539/25887/M-Sc%20for%20Faculty%20Bright%20Mutandwa.pdf;jsessionid=DAE507C0F7F33F7A8981755B20E9FAF9?sequence=2.

Nhachi. T. O. (2015). The need for sustainability reporting and disclosure by extractive companies. Publish What You Pay: Position paper on key mining reforms in Zimbabwe, Retrieved from https://me-dia.africaportal.org/documents/Publish\_What\_You\_Pay\_Zimbabwe\_2015\_Dec.pdf65.

Nsaikila. M. (2015). Poverty, resource endowments and conflicts in Sub-Saharan Africa. A re-examination of the resource curse hypothesis. Thesis for: Masters Arts Economics. Retrieved from https://www.google.com/search?client=safari&rls=en&q=Nsaikila+Melaine+Nyuyfoni:+Poverty,+Resource+Endowments+and+Conflicts+in+Sub-Saharan+++Africa.&ie=UTF-8&oe=UTF -8.

Nsaikila. M. (2015). Poverty, resource endowment and conflicts in Sub-Saharan Africa, A re-examination of the resource curse hypothesis, A Thesis: Presented to the Department of Economics and Decision Sciences Western Illinois University, In Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree Masters of Arts in Economics.

Parliament of Zimbabwe. (2016). First Report of the Portfolio Committee on Mines and Energy on diamond mining (with special reference to Marange Diamond Fields) 2009 – 2013.

Pegg. S. (2003). Poverty Reduction or Poverty Exacerbation? World Bank Group

Support for Extractive Industries in Africa. A report sponsored by Oxfam America, Friends of the Earth-US, Environmental Defense, Catholic Relief Services and the Bank Information Center. Department of Political Science Indiana University Purdue University Indianapolis (IUPUI). Available at: https://s3.amazonaws.com/oxfam-us/www/static/media/-files/poverty-reduction-or-poverty-exacerbation.pdf.

Pegg, S. (2006). Mining and Poverty Reduction: Transforming Rhetoric into Reality. Journal of Cleaner Production, 14: 376–87.

Poncian. J., & Kigodi. H. M. (2018). Transparency initiatives and Tanzania's extractive industry governance. Development Studies Research, 5(1): 106-121. DOI:10.1080/21665095.2018.1486219. Publish What You Pay (2015). Position paper on key Mining Reforms in Zimbabwe. Retrieved from:

https://media.africaportal.org/documents/Publish\_What\_You\_Pay\_Zimbabwe\_2015\_Dec.pdf.

OXFAM. (2017). From aspiration to reality: Unpacking the Africa Mining Vision. Retrieved from www.oxfam.org.

Rathinam. F., Cardoz, P, Siddiqui, Z and Gaarder, M. (2019). Transparency and Accountability in the Extractives Sector: A synthesis of what works and what does not? Working Paper 33. New Delhi: International Initiative for Impact Evaluation (3ie). Retrieved from doi: https://doi.org/10.23846/WP0033

Research (UNU/WIDER), WIDER Annual Lectures 5. United Nations Development

Programme (2013), 'Humanity Divided:

Confronting Inequality in Developing Countries,' Available at: https://www.wider.unu.edu/about/wider-annual-lecture.

Results of ODI research presented in preliminary form for discussion and critical comment January 2009. Overseas Development Institute 111 Westminster Bridge Road London SE1 7JD. Retrieved from https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/860.pdf

Sibanda. M, Nickerson. E, & Maduma. B. (2020). Transparency and the challenging

path to accountability, lessons from Gwanda mining community. Retrieved from: https://mukasirisibanda.wordpress.com/2020/01/30/transparency-and-the-challenging-path-toaccountability-lessons-from-gwanda-mining-community/.

Sen, A. K. (1999). Development as freedom, Anchor Books.

Standing. A and Hilson. G. (2013). Distributing mining wealth to communities in Ghana: Addressing problems of elite capture and political corruption. Anti- Corruption Resource Centre. Retrieved from https://www.u4.no/publications/distributing-min-ing-wealth-to-communities-in-ghana-addressing-problems-of-elite-capture-and-political-corruption.pdf

The International Institute for Sustainable Development. (2018). State of Sustainability Initiatives Review: Standards and the Extractive Sector. Retrieved from https://www.iisd.org/system/files/publications/igf-ssi-review-extractive-economy.pdf

UNDP. (2013). Reflections on social accountability: Catalyzing democratic governance to accelerate progress towards the Millennium Development Goals.

Vaismoradi, M. & Snelgrove, S. (2019). Theme in Qualitative Content Analysis and Thematic Analysis. Qualitative Social Research. 20(3). Retrieved from http://www.qualitativeresearch.net/index.php/fqs/arti-cle/view/3376/4470.

Wuest, J. (1995). Breaking the barriers to nursing research. The Canadian Nurse, 91(4): 29-33.

Young, F. W., and Young, R. C. 1961. Key Informant Reliability in Rural Mexican Villages. Human Organisation, 20:141-148.

Zaba. F. (2019). US\$12bn target: Consult widely. Zimbabwe Independent, 29, November 2019. Retrieved from https://www.theindependent.co.zw/2019/11/29/us12bn-target-consult-widely/.66.

Zeegers, M., and Barron, D. (2015). in Milestone Moments in Getting your PhD in Qualitative Research, Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/topics/social-sciences/documentanalysis.

Zimbabwe Geological Survey (2017). Retrieved from http://www.zeparu.co.zw/sites/default/files/2018-03/Reconfiguration%20of%20the%20Zimbabwe%20Geological%20Survey%20web.pdf Zimbabwe's Labour Force Pact and The Institute for Sustainability Africa. (2017). Employment Creation Potential Analysis by Sector. Retrieved from https://www.ilo.org/africa/media-centre/news/WCMS\_488800/lang--en/index.htm ZIMMCODD. (2018). The Impact of Foreign Direct Investment in the Mining Sector in Zimbabwe: A Social, Economic and Environmental Impact Analysis, The Case of Chivi, Gwanda, Hwange, Marange, Mutoko and Penhalonga. Available at: http://zimcodd.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/The-Im-

pact-of-Foreign-Direct-Investment-in-the-Mining-Sector-in-Zimbabwe\_Final-Edit-2.pdf. Accessed on: December 2020.











